

# **U.S.-Russia Joint Commission on POW/MIAs**

## **Technical Talks**

**20 February 2017**

**Russian Ministry of Defense**

**Main Directorate for International Military Cooperation**

**22/2 Frunzenskaya Embankment**

**Moscow, Russian Federation**

### **U.S. Side Participants:**

- Colonel Christopher S. Forbes, USA, Director, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency (DPAA)
- Dr. James G. Connell, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency (DPAA), Lead Analyst, Cold War Working Group, and Acting Executive Secretary, U.S. Side of the USRJC
- Mr. Henry Eastman, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, DPAA, Lead Analyst, World War II Working Group
- Mr. Daniel Baughman, Asia Pacific Directorate, DPAA, Lead Analyst, Korean War Working Group
- Ms. Svetlana P. Shevchenko, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, DPAA, Lead Analyst, Vietnam War Working Group
- Major James H. Harvey, USA, Chief, Moscow Detachment, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, DPAA
- MSgt Scott A. Erwin, USAF, Researcher, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, DPAA
- Dr. Vladislav Sorokin, Chief Researcher, Moscow Detachment, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, DPAA
- Mr. Mikhail Smolyaninov, Researcher, Moscow Detachment, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, DPAA
- Ms. Irina Koryakina, Researcher, Moscow Detachment, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, DPAA

### **Russian Side Participants:**

- General-Colonel (Ret) Valeriy Vostrotnin, Chairman of the Russian Side, USRJC
- General-Major (Ret) Alexander Kirilin, Deputy Chairman of the Russian Side, USRJC
- Colonel (Ret) Andrey Taranov, Executive Secretary of the Russian Side
- Dr. Nikolay Nikiforov, USRJC, Head of WWII Working Group
- Dr. Yelena Tsunayeva, USRJC, WWII Working Group

- Colonel Eduard Paderin, USRJC, Head of Vietnam Working Group
- Mr. Alexander Lavrentyev, USRJC, Head of Cold War Working Group
- Mr. Alexander Mukomolov, USRJC, North Caucasian Region
- Ms. Iolanta Mikhailova, USRJC, Russian Red Cross

**Other Participants from the Russian Side:**

- Vladlen Epifanov, Liaison Officer, Russian Ministry of Foreign Affairs
- Alexander Shilin, Liaison Officer, Russian Ministry of Foreign Affairs
- Sergey Lipatov, Expert, WWII Working Group
- Vladimir Fesenko, Expert, WWII Working Group
- Andrey Baranov, Expert, Korean War Working Group
- Victor Gavrilov, Expert, Korean War Working Group
- Andrey Tikhonov, Expert, Korean War Working Group
- Victoria Kayaeva, Expert, Korean War Working Group
- Andrey Pochtarev, Expert, Korean War Working Group
- Alexander Voronovich, Expert, Vietnam War Working Group
- Sergey Migulin, Expert, Vietnam War Working Group
- Sergey Pokladov, Expert, Vietnam War Working Group
- Vladimir Popov, Chief, Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Fallen Defenders of the Fatherland, Ministry of Defense of Russia
- Yuri Kargin, Chief, International Section, Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Fallen Defenders of the Fatherland
- Igor Goncharenko, Consultant, Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Fallen Defenders of the Fatherland
- Maria Ksenofontova, Senior Specialist, Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Fallen Defenders of the Fatherland
- Elena Gritsenko, Senior Archivist, Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Fallen Defenders of the Fatherland

**Opening Session, 10:00-12:00, 21 February 2017**

**General-Colonel (Ret) Vostrotn:** I would like to call these Technical Talks to order and welcome Colonel Forbes and our U.S. colleagues. The USRJC has a long history that started 25 years ago this year and we have been tasked with the creation of a commemorative medallion. One of the main tasks of our commission is to create an opportunity for the two sides to cooperate, continue their long working relationship, overcome obstacles, and set a good example to our politicians. This Commission is dedicated to the search for our POW/MIAs, and the people of both countries have a long history. We have become allies in our struggles against global terrorism. The fact that we are meeting together is an example of our dedication, and despite the political issues we face, the mission of the Commission remains a humanitarian mission.

The composition of the Russian Side is set out in the Diplomatic Note of 2009 and the Presidential Decree of 2014. These documents underscore the importance of this Commission to the Russian government. As of right now, no analogous documents listing the members of the U.S. Side exists. These documents should describe how we will conduct work, and establish the atmosphere for this important work. We must have these documents in order to move forward, and I express hope that this issue will be resolved.

The mission of keeping alive the memories of those who fell while defending their fatherland is a noble endeavor. During these meetings, experts from WWII, Korea, Vietnam, the Cold War and local conflicts will come together in this hall to discuss those matters that we discussed during the last plenary session, and we should also discuss the matters concerning the preparation for the next plenary session.

At this time, I would like to introduce the members of the Russian Side. (General-Colonel Vostrotin introduces all members of the Russian Side).

If time allows and the weather cooperates tomorrow, we would like to tour the facility at Patriot Park. This is a very large venue, which showcases military history and cooperation.

### **Comments from the U.S. Side**

**Colonel Forbes:** On the behalf of General Foglesong, the Chairman from the U.S. Side of the Commission, I wish to thank you General Vostrotin for hosting these talks. Today is extremely important as we conduct the first USRJC Technical Talks since 1997. I would first like to express my disappointment in the fact that Mr. Tim Shea, the U.S. Intelligence Commissioner, was unable to obtain a visa in time and is unable to attend as we had planned. Perhaps in the future all members of the U.S. Side of the Commission will be provided a one-year, multiple entry Russian visa. We would very much like to maintain the momentum that was started by the last plenary session, and we look forward to these meetings occurring more regularly and more frequently. A one-year visa for Commission members would help facilitate that process. (JCSD Note: The day following these technical talks, Mr. Shea received a one-year, multiple entry Russian visa.)

The overall goals for the U.S. Side during these technical talks are: 1) conduct an in-progress review following the Plenary Session in May 2016, 2) continue to build on our relationship as a joint commission, 3) plan for our future meetings. The more specific goals from the U.S. Side are: 1) identify Russian subject-matter expert counterparts for each working group, so our subject-matter experts can begin to build a relationship on the issues, 2) reinvigorate the Vietnam Working Group. We have recently assigned Ms. Svetlana Shevchenko as our dedicated senior analyst to the Vietnam Working Group in our Joint Commission Support Division (JCSD) and she is present with us today.

General-Colonel Vostrotnin, on behalf of Ms. Ann Mills-Griffiths, Chairman of the **National League of POW/MIA Families**, we would like to invite you to speak at the League's annual event in Washington, D.C., this June. I believe the last time a Russian representative attended an annual meeting was in 2005. If you are willing, perhaps you could even speak to some of the family members. Our work here is very important to them, and we should show them that we are working together again. We are very pleased with the outcome of the last plenary session, and it generated a lot of interest among family members of the missing. We would like to spend some time planning future events. These events include the aforementioned League meeting as well as the Korean/Cold War meeting in August. Also, we are greatly looking forward to the next plenary session to be held in November 2017 in Russia, and we should discuss some specific details for the next plenary session.

I am very pleased with the group of experts that have gathered here today. It is better if the working groups consist of experts in these conflicts. Difficult challenges on both sides exist, but we can find a way forward. I am very interested in discussing the design and production of the 25<sup>th</sup> Anniversary medallion, and in emphasizing that, despite the political situation facing both sides, this is above all else a humanitarian mission.

I recently met with former members of the Commission in order to discuss their experience over the years. I met with Dennis Clift, who was the U.S. Chairman for the Cold War Working Group. We discussed the seventeen years that Mr. Clift had dedicated to the USRJC. Mr. Clift said that the U.S. Side had been provided 16,000 documents by 2001, they had interviewed more than 3,000 Soviet veterans, and that this work had led to the clarification of fates of 140 U.S. Airmen and the fates of 43 Soviets as well. This demonstrates that we have had many successes in the past, and we hope to see even more success in the future as we seek to determine the fates of our missing. I look forward to our continued cooperation as we come together in a spirit of mutual respect for such a noble cause.

I would like to introduce Mr. Henry Eastman, our expert on WWII.

**Mr. Henry Eastman:** Good Morning. I would like to briefly summarize the topics which I plan to discuss during the working group meeting. The first topic will be a follow-up to requests made by Mr. Maxim Alexeyev to General Foglesong. These requests focus on the exhumation reports on the four unknowns, who are buried in the Ardennes cemetery and also information concerning the Russian pilots who crashed in Elizabeth City, North Carolina. I would also like to briefly mention the success we had with the recovery of 2<sup>nd</sup> Lieutenant Mumford's remains in Ukraine. This recovery was made possible due to the research done in the Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense (TsAMO). Finally, I would like to thank the Russian Side for the information that has been put on-line. Information found on-line may pertain to the loss of 1st Lieutenant McCarthy in the Moldova/Ukraine border area.

**General-Colonel (Ret) Vostroin:** I inadvertently failed to introduce Mr. Maxim Alexeyev and to note that I am very grateful for the work that he has done in Washington, D.C. One item that I would like to highlight is the return of two awards, including a Hero of the Soviet Union medal, by Mr. Henry Sakaida. This is a huge and humble gesture, and he will present these awards back to the family members on 24 February 2017 at Barvikha Concert Hall.

**Mr. Maxim Alexeyev:** We are continuing the work in D.C., and we are still hiring staff and organizing the office. I appreciate the support that we have received from Colonel Forbes and from Dr. James Connell. It is not simply the business of navigating the political atmosphere; it is good working with DPAA. The people from DPAA are honest, friendly, and cooperative. The Russian Office in D.C. is continuing to work at NARA [National Archives and Records Administration]. We are especially looking at German documents to clarify the fates of Soviet citizens during World War II. I would like to have meetings with DPAA every 1-2 months to discuss technical issues. Our cooperation with the DPAA office started with a wreath laying in Annapolis, Maryland, in August 2015, and I would also like to note the tremendous help we have received from Dr. James Connell, without whose help much of our work would not have been possible. We have located over 100 burial sites in the United States, and a special thank you to the American people for the efforts made to maintain these sites. We had a successful trip in April 2016 to Norfolk, Virginia, where we found the remains of six Russian sailors, and have identified three of them. We hope to find the personal information of the remaining three from the naval archives. I feel that we need to develop protocols for dealing with cemeteries, and I do not feel that government-to-government action should be necessary to get things done. The exchange of diplomatic notes should have already established the precedent for this. There is a provision concerning the marking of commemorative sites. Some of these sites are located on military installations, and we should create procedures on how to visit these sites. I would also like to learn about how the Russian government can participate in the upkeep of sites that are located in National Parks. Thank you very much for the support the U.S. Side has shown us.

**Colonel Forbes:** It was indeed a great honor to participate in the ceremony in Norfolk, and it is an example of how we can work together. I look forward to working on such issues in the future and propose future meetings where the organizations can help with various requests. We will coordinate with Maxim and conduct a monthly coordination meeting with his team in D.C. Of course we are always available to assist in any way we can. In regards to Russian burials in our National Parks, we will coordinate with our DPAA Policy Director and find the right point of contact in our government for you to work with. I think the National Parks Service is the best agency, but let us verify.

**Dr. Connell:** We conducted an excavation in Severomorsk, Russia, and we should not have any problems in assisting with them here in the United States.

**General-Colonel (Ret) Vostrotn:** I would like to recognize Major Harvey. When I found out that he was departing Russia this summer I was very disappointed. I have great respect for him professionally and personally.

**Major Harvey:** I would like to thank the Russian Side for hosting the U.S. Side in this facility. Our office has a very good working relationship in Russia. Our office would not be able to function without our Foreign Service Nationals, and I would like to thank the most patient man in the room: Colonel (Ret) Taranov. The efforts of our Moscow-based team have not gone unnoticed here and in the United States. The U.S. Ambassador is very much looking forward to our report on these proceedings. Over the last 18 months, much progress has been made starting with the plenum in D.C. The steady progress made by the office is owed greatly to Colonel Tikhonov of the Central Archives of the Russian Ministry of Defense (TsAMO), but our work is not limited to archival research. We have expanded our communications with veterans groups thanks to the Red Cross. Much progress has been made thanks to the help of the web sites created by Colonel Taranov. It has been an honor to work in this office for 18 months, and we will continue with preparations for the next plenum.

**General-Colonel (Ret) Vostrotn:** I am very pleased with the work of this Commission. Despite political differences, the two Sides have come together with the main objective being to find those missing in action. I accept the invitation to come to the United States in June, and you will receive my official response through the appropriate channels. Now, I would like to discuss briefly the 25<sup>th</sup> Anniversary medallion. There are currently two versions, which I would like to present to Colonel Forbes. They contain symbols that reflect POW camps and agreed upon figures. There is still time for discussion, and we will send the official proposal via the DPAA office in Moscow.

**Colonel Forbes:** The design is good, and we will continue to work with you on the design. The POW flag was created by the National League of POW/MIA Families, and that symbol is very significant in the United States. We will give this medallion out to special members and to major organizations such as the National League of POW/MIA Families, the Veterans of Foreign Wars, and to those who helped the USRJC. I believe that the phrase “You Are Not Forgotten” is also significant in Russia.

**General-Colonel (Ret) Vostrotn:** Colonel Forbes, you have changed the flow of the conversation now that you have elevated this to the level of an award. We will need to think of the status of the medal, and if it becomes an award, there will be a need for an official certificate. This could be awarded to representatives, interested parties, and to individuals such as Henry Sakaida. Now, I would like to close my part of the opening session and invite any additional comments.

**Colonel Forbes:** I would like to say a few words. In September, I traveled to Moscow with Ms. Heather Harris, and we laid a wreath at Russia’s Tomb of the Unknown Soldier. We

considered it a great honor. At that time we also spoke with you, General Vostrovin, and we decided that we needed three issues that we could lay on the altar of victory. These three items include the Korean War-era maps, new discussions of the 6 November 1951 P2V shoot down, and new search avenues for ten cases from the Vietnam War. We chose these ten cases based on information presented from the Russian Side. This information was presented in 356 excerpts from source documents held in TsAMO, and we would like to know if we could look for information in other archives. I understand that you cannot declassify material wholesale; that would also be unacceptable in the United States. I request that pertinent information be redacted, declassified, and released where possible. I understand the size of the task and look forward to working with the Russian Side in solving it.

**General-Colonel (Ret) Vostrovin:** If we discussed these issues in May, then we will bring these issues to resolution. Colonel Paderin will get the requested information concerning Vietnam. We will try to make exceptions where we can, but we will need to compromise. I hope that we will be able to work in a more comfortable atmosphere in the future. I spoke with Vladimir Shamanov and other former Commission members. In fact, Shamanov may be able to help us. He is now Head of the State Duma Defense Committee, and much of the future cooperation will rely on him. However, he is familiar with the Commission, and all should proceed smoothly.

**Colonel Forbes:** Before we conclude this morning session, I want to give our other three working group leads the opportunity to say a few words. They will present their specific comments at the working group sessions this afternoon.

**Dr. Connell:** I am Dr. James G. Connell Jr., the senior Cold War research analyst at DPAA. I have been working with the USRJC for all but two months of its twenty-five year existence. I arrived at Embassy Moscow in May 1992 and became the first acting chief of our Moscow office that Major Harvey heads so ably now. I was privileged to serve in Moscow for nine years, four years as Deputy Chief of POW/MIA Moscow and five years as Chief. My years in Russia were spent traveling all over the former Soviet Union working in archives and interviewing witnesses with possible information on missing American and former Soviet military personnel. Since 2001, I have been a research analyst with DPAA and its predecessors. Since 2012, I have been Acting Executive Secretary of the U.S. Side of the USRJC. Much of my work has dealt with the Cold War shoot downs, and in our work this afternoon with Mr. Lavrentyev, whose stellar reputation precedes him, I hope we can make progress towards finding additional information on the 6 November 1951 shoot down on a U.S. Navy P2V maritime patrol aircraft. As a Naval Academy graduate and a retired naval officer, this incident holds special significance for me. It is a great honor to be here, and it has been a great honor to work closely with Maxim in America for almost two years.

**Mr. Baughman:** I am Dan Baughman, a retired U.S. Army Lieutenant Colonel and senior analyst at DPAA. I have been involved in research and U.S. remains recovery in China and North Korea since 1995. I am sitting in for long-time Korean War senior analyst Danz Blasser

who has also worked with the USRJC and Task Force Russia/DPMO/DPAA since 1992. Danz was unable to make the trip for these Technical Talks but sends his best wishes for their success and warm greetings for our colleagues here, both old and new.

**Ms. Shevchenko:** My name is Svetlana Shevchenko. I was born, raised, and educated in the Soviet Union (actually, my University is around the corner). My tenure with DPAA and its predecessor organization just crossed a ten-year mark, mostly supporting the USRJC. Looking for information for missing personnel is not only professional but also personal to me: I have three missing from WWII in my own family. I found the information about them thanks to General Kirilin, who made it available online several years ago. I am honored to be part of this mission and would like to reiterate General Vostrotin's words – we are doing it to mutually respect the memory of the fallen heroes. I am looking forward to the discussion of the Vietnam War-related matters this afternoon.

**General Vostrotin:** We will now adjourn for lunch at the Na Znamenke Café which is not very far from the Russian “Pentagon.” We will need to go there by car.

## WWII Working Group Session, 14:00-16:30, 21 February 2017

### Participants on the U.S. Side:

- Mr. Henry H. Eastman, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency (DPAA), Lead Analyst, World War II Working Group
- Mr. Mikhail Smolyaninov, Researcher, Moscow Detachment, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, DPAA

### Participants on the Russian Side:

- Dr. Nikolaj Nikiforov, member of the U.S.-Russia Joint Commission on POW/MIAs (USRJC), World War II Working Group leader, Deputy Chief of the Research Institute of Military History of the General Staff of the Armed Forces of the Russian Federation.
- Colonel (Ret) Andrey Taranov, Deputy Director, Russian MoD Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Fallen Defenders of the Fatherland and Executive Secretary of the Russian Side of the USRJC.
- Ms. Iolanta Mikhailova, Director of the non-governmental agency “Russian Red Cross Research and Information,” public organization.
- Dr. Andrey Pochtarev, leader of the support group for the Russian Side of the USRJC.

**Colonel (Ret) Taranov:** The current areas of priority of the WWII Working Group are: The Russian Side continues its work in the National Archives in Washington with captured documents of German camps liberated by the U.S. Army in the territory of Europe. These documents concern the Soviet citizens kept in those camps. Also, the Russian Side helps the U.S. Side find information about downed aircraft in the Kurile Islands and U.S. POWs liberated by the Red Army. Unfortunately, the Russian Side has not been provided with aerial photography materials and is still waiting for fresh information. We have a report that a search team found a U.S. bomber aircraft crashed on Paramushir Island that may have its crew on board. This is still unconfirmed. The Russian Side is looking into this and afterwards will inform the U.S. Side of all details regarding this case. Concerning the submarine that sank near the island of Matua, an expedition is being planned. It should explore the place with the help of side-scan sonar. Also, the Russian Side has unconfirmed information on another U.S. submarine in the Sea of Okhotsk. This information also has to be clarified and the U.S. Side will be informed as soon as possible.

**Mr. Eastman:** Thank you, Mr. Taranov. We look forward to hearing more about these finds, especially about the bomber on Paramushir Island.

*Colonel (Ret) Taranov departs. Dr. Nikiforov leads for the Russian Side.*

**Dr. Nikiforov:** We are ready to hear your issues.

**Mr. Eastman:** I would like to begin by addressing some requests made by the Russian Side. In January, Mr. Alexeyev sent a letter to General Foglesong requesting exhumation reports on the four unknowns buried in the Ardennes American Cemetery at Neuville, Belgium. If you do not mind, I would like to provide the background to this case because it is a good story. This case pertains to a PBN-1 Nomad, commonly called a “Catalina,” that crashed into the Andotten Cliff in Norway on 17 June 1944. A Norwegian fisherman witnessed the crash and reported it to the German authorities.

When the Germans investigated the crash site, they found American currency and other American manufactured products, and the markings on the wreckage led them to believe it was an American aircraft. At the crash site, the Germans recovered four sets of remains, which they buried in the local cemetery at Hasvik in a collective grave marked with a wooden cross.

After the war, the American Graves Registration Command (AGRC) conducted a major effort to locate, identify, and inter American service personnel who were unaccounted-for after the war. In June 1946, the AGRC disinterred these four sets of remains, took them to Neuville, Belgium, and buried them on 19 July 1946. On 15 August 1948, the AGRC disinterred the remains for analysis. They prepared dental charts and performed forensic analysis on the remains. However, neither the forensic analysis of the remains, nor the other circumstances surrounding the crash, matched any known American losses.

Therefore, in December 1949, the AGRC Board of Review declared the remains, which are labeled as X-4205, X-4206, X-4207, and X-4209 to be unidentifiable. All were subsequently reinterred at Neuville, which today is known as the Ardennes American Cemetery. At the time, no one considered that the remains could belong to anyone but an American aircrew. However, the circumstances of this loss correlate very closely to the circumstances surrounding the loss of Colonel Viktor Nikolayevich Vasilyev of the Red Army of the Soviet Union.

In March 1944, the U.S. government began providing PBN-1 Nomad flying boats as part of its Lend-Lease program. These were intended to help support the Soviet Northern Fleet drive back German submarines and surface ships from the Barents and Norwegian Seas. The first Soviet crews arrived in the United States in April 1944 and began training to fly the PBN-1 Nomad. After a month of training, the Russian crews began flying the Nomads back to the Soviet Union. Their route ran from Elizabeth City, N.C., along the east coast up to Newfoundland, then to Iceland, and finally arriving in Murmansk, Russia.

The longest leg of this trip was the one from Reykjavik, Iceland, to Vaenga Airfield, near Murmansk, a grueling flight that could last up to nineteen hours. Colonel Vasilyev was on such a ferrying flight from the United States on 17 June 1944.

Colonel Vasilyev’s last radio communication was that he was “on course heading 066 degrees at an altitude of 500 meters and the water was visible.” The aircraft that received this

communication was about twenty miles away. The weather was very bad. This would have put the PBN-1 only halfway between Iceland and Norway, high up in the Norwegian Sea.

Neither he nor his crew was ever seen alive again. As you can see, the circumstances of Colonel Vasilyev's loss correspond with the aircraft crash into the Andotten Cliff in Norway on 17 June 1944. On behalf of General Foglesong, I would like to present you with an answer to Mr. Alexeyev's request and provide the complete files associated with these remains known as X-4205, X-4206, X-4207, and X-4209.

It is hoped that this will bring us a step closer to identifying these brave men who died in service to their country and in bringing some closure to their loved ones.

**Dr. Nikiforov:** Thank you.

**Mr. Eastman:** I would also like to address Mr. Alexeyev's second request to General Foglesong concerning the search for the remains of the four Soviet airmen who perished on 11 January 1945 near Elizabeth City, North Carolina. They were also taking part in the same Lend-Lease project as Colonel Vasilyev, the operation known as Project Zebra.

The U.S. Side conducted an additional search at the Naval History and Heritage Command, the Museum of the Albemarle in Elizabeth City, and at the National Archives and Records Administration. Unfortunately, we were not able to locate an Aircraft Accident Report for this crash, although those reports generally do not mention anything about the disposition of the bodies.

We did find some additional information concerning Project Zebra, under which this aircrew was receiving flight training on the PBN-1. On behalf of General Foglesong, I am passing you copies of the documents we found.

Though we could not find any additional information on the disposition of the remains, we do have a proposal for you. DPAA Historian, Dr. Ed Burton, has volunteered to assist one of your Russian researchers in Washington in a search for further information on the disposition of the remains of the other crew members.

Dr. Burton is a very talented researcher. In fact, he is the author of the case narrative on Colonel Vasilyev, which we gave to last September. We also summarized the case narrative for you, using Dr. Burton's words, just now.

I believe that working together this way will help us develop a practical, working relationship between our researchers. I propose that our office in Arlington, Virginia, work with Mr. Alexeyev in Washington, D.C., next week to set a date for one of your researchers to meet with Dr. Burton to begin this joint archival research project.

Together we may be able to find the documents that point to where the remains of these brave airmen are located.

**Mr. Alexeyev:** Yes, I agree. Thank you for the information you found.

**Dr. Pochtarev:** Concerning the PBN-1 which crashed near Elizabeth City, North Carolina, on 11 January 1945, the Russian Side has information that among five perished pilots one was a Canadian citizen, while the remaining four crew members were Russians. On 5 February 1945, the remains of the Canadian crew member were handed over to Canadian (Toronto) representatives. In July 1945, one of the cremated Russian pilots was buried at Donskoe Cemetery in Moscow. Somehow the Russians assumed that the remains of the leader of the crew consisted of a part of his hand. But the Russians are still unaware where the cremation took place and where the remains of the rest of the three crew members were buried.

Concerning the PBN-1 Nomad led by Colonel Vasilyev, which crashed in Norway on 17 June 1944, among the six crew members, the Russians managed to find just two granddaughters of the navigator, Colonel Mostepan. So, only they may help in case of forensic analysis of the crew members remains. Also, Russian researchers have information that the Germans assumed that the crew members of the downed PBN-1 were Russians, and they asked the locals to bury them at one of local cemeteries.

**Mr. Eastman:** That is interesting. We do not have any indication that the fisherman who witnessed the crash in Norway mentioned any Russians during his interview. We believe they were buried as Americans.

Concerning the Elizabeth City crash, we should make another attempt to move forward. When we return to Washington, D.C., Mr. Alexeyev and I will organize a meeting of U.S. historians and Russian experts.

**Mr. Alexeyev:** Yes, I agree.

**Mr. Eastman:** There are two other cases that I mentioned during the opening session. The first is a good-news story. We have managed to find, recover, and identify the remains of Army Air Forces 2nd Lieutenant John D. Mumford.

In June 1944, Lieutenant Mumford took part in Operation FRANTIC, a series of shuttle bombing operations conducted by American aircraft based in Great Britain and Southern Italy. During the predawn hours of 2 June 1944, his unit was informed that they were heading to Ukraine, Soviet Union.

The bombers and fighters of Operation FRANTIC landed at Poltava, Mirgorod, or Piryatin, all in Ukraine. Over the following few days, the Americans began to get a sense of their Soviet ally, the conditions on the Eastern Front, and what two years of German occupation had meant to the Poltava area. The Americans were impressed by the locals, their friendliness and work ethic.

On 6 June 1944, Lieutenant Mumford flew his last mission as the pilot and sole occupant of a P-51C “Mustang” fighter. He was accompanying and protecting a flight of B-17 “Flying Fortress” bombers on their mission to bomb and destroy a German-occupied airfield at Galati, Romania.

After successfully completing the bombing mission, the bombers and their escort fighters came under attack by German fighters. Mumford was last seen by fellow pilots in pursuit of two German fighters. And that was all that was known about the circumstances surrounding his loss for the next 60 years.

The Russian Side assisted us with archival research in September 2010 when you permitted our researchers to review the files of 169th Special Purpose Aviation Base and Romanian trophy documents. We thank you for the help you provided.

The archival research was performed along with interviews of some eyewitnesses and the residents of Novi Troyany, Ukraine, which is near the location where Mumford went down. Ms. Shevchenko of DPAA found some eyewitnesses at Novi Troyany who observed two aircraft with U.S. markings pursued by several German aircraft. One of the U.S. aircraft crashed in a nearby field.

Last summer Ms. Shevchenko was part of a recovery team that travelled to Novi Troyany and conducted an excavation where remains were found that were later identified in the laboratory as belonging to 2nd Lieutenant Mumford. Soon 2nd Lieutenant Mumford will be interred with the full military honors that he deserves.

Once again, we would like to express our appreciation for the assistance provided by the Russian Side of the Commission.

**Dr. Nikiforov:** You are welcome. The work done by the World War II Working Group is very important.

**Mr. Eastman:** Now, I would like to ask for your help in clarifying the fate of 1st Lieutenant John G. McCarthy. Lieutenant McCarthy also took part in the same operation as Lieutenant Mumford, Operation FRANTIC.

Even though I am asking for your help, I must first point out that you have already helped us in a significant way. Our researchers found some documents pertinent to this case on your “Pamyat Naroda” website. It is a very useful website, and I’m sure Russian citizens are very grateful for it.

By way of background, allow me to give you the U.S. version of events surrounding Lieutenant McCarthy’s loss. Lieutenant John Gerard McCarthy served as the pilot of a P-51D Mustang, tail number 44-13453, in the 5th Fighter Squadron, 52nd Fighter Group, 15th Air Force, based in Madna, Italy.

On 4 August 1944, the 15th Air Force sent over 70 P-38 fighter-bombers and P-51 fighter aircraft from Madna, Italy, to attack two airfields near the town of Focsani, Romania, in support of Operation FRANTIC. According to the mission report, the P-51s were supposed to escort the P-38s on ingress, over the targets, and during egress, while the latter would strafe their targets. The P-51s were then to head to their recovery base in Piryatin, Ukraine, USSR.

The fighting was intense, and McCarthy's flight of four P-51s, led by 1st Lieutenant Schumacher, became separated from the squadron. Schumacher decided to head for the recovery base at Piryatin.

At about 1150 hours, Schumacher sighted a large river, which he thought was the Dnieper River near Kremenchug. The flight was engaged with intense, accurate flak. Schumacher mistakenly believed that this flak was from the Russians at the Kremenchug area, as the group was flying northwest to Piryatin. In fact, Schumacher's group was flying over the German-Soviet battle line along the Dniester River at the Ukraine-Moldova border.

According to Schumacher, at 1220 hours, about one kilometer NW of Malaiesti, in present-day Moldova (Transnistria), McCarthy's tail section broke off in mid-air, causing his aircraft to go straight into the ground and explode.

In an attempt to obtain additional information on the Soviet units operating in the area of Malaiesti at the time when Lieutenant McCarthy was lost, our researchers (Mikhail Smolyaninov and Vladislav Sorokin) went to your "Pamyat Naroda" website and searched the digitized records of the Soviet 57th Army.

On this website they found the Combat Operations Log of the 57th Army, on pages 4-5, dated 4 August 1944:

'At 1400 on 08/04, in the area 1.5 km southeast of Krasnaya Gorka, a Mustang fighter hit by enemy fire crashed and burned. The pilot RUM of Washington bailed out of the aircraft and was killed when he hit the ground, as his parachute did not deploy.'

Krasnaya Gorka is 3 km to the west of Malaiesti. The difference between Lieutenant Schumacher's estimate of where Lieutenant McCarthy's Mustang went down and the location in the 57th Army's Operations Log is roughly 2-4 kilometers. The difference in time could possibly be explained by the time used: Moscow vs. Italian vs. GMT.

We are reviewing our records, but it does not appear that the U.S. lost any other P-51 Mustangs on this date and in this area, where the remains were not recovered.

Lieutenant McCarthy was from New York, not Washington. It is unclear from the 57th operations log exactly what document was used to identify the pilot. It is quite possible that they found some mangled document and drew an incorrect conclusion from this document that his name was RUM and he was from Washington.

Perhaps it was a partial blood chit? In any case, this is a good lead that needs to be explored further. Here is where I wish to ask for your assistance.

You know our Moscow Detachment's researchers very well. Vladislav Sorokin and Mikhail Smolyaninov are very competent, professional, and personable. They, along with Irina Koryakina and Major James Harvey, make a good team. We are very proud of them.

Unfortunately, we lost one of our team in 2015, Mikhail Nosov, who passed away unexpectedly at age 49. Misha was with us for over 10 years, working primarily in the State Archives of the Russian Federation (GARF). He did good work, and we miss him.

Now, following the 20th Plenum, we intend to fill the position left vacant when Misha Nosov passed away. We expect that this new researcher will work primarily in the Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense (TsAMO), assisting Vladislav Sorokin and Mikhail Smolyaninov in their research in the declassified files pertaining to the Korean War and World War II.

We intend to focus much more than we have in the past on World War II-era research. I brought up Lieutenant McCarthy's case as an example. We would like to request access to the inventories (*opisi*) of the 57th Army and its subordinate units. This may also lead to some inventories and files needing to be declassified.

We already have a good working relationship between our researchers and the staff at TsAMO. Colonels Tikhonov and Permyakov are very knowledgeable and helpful. We thank them for all the assistance they have rendered to us in the past.

It is our desire to take our working relationship to a new level of cooperation, both here in Moscow and in Washington. This will benefit both sides in our efforts to clarify the fates of the missing and to honor the memory of those who perished in service of their countries.

We would also like to look at some administrative issues. Would it be possible to increase the number of research days at TsAMO each month from 8 days to 12 days? We may be at our capacity with 8 days, but just in case we needed to work extra days in a particular month we would like to have this flexibility.

Also, we would like to have a standing access roster for U.S. researchers to work at TsAMO. The names on the list would include our researchers based in Moscow, but also some names of researchers based in Washington, D.C.

Your colleague in Washington, Dr. Tim Nenninger, always has his doors open at the National Archives and Records Administration for you.

**Dr. Nikiforov:** I would like to again underline the importance of the WWII Working Group and thank you for the information provided by the U.S. Side on the PBN-1 Nomad crashed into the Andotten Cliff in Norway on 17 June 1944. With respect to the request for an extension of the monthly eight-day period of work in TsAMO and establishing a standing approval for a few researchers from Washington to conduct archival research there, there is a procedure for

approving access for work in TsAMO that cannot be changed because other agencies are involved in this matter. Other points of the request may be resolved without any difficulties, however, it is a weighty argument you make about NARA. Please pass my regards to Tim Nenninger. I promise to discuss the issue with Permyakov, Chief of TsAMO, as soon as possible after the meeting.

According to the requirement to provide archival documents which are still classified or trophy documents which are not processed by Russian specialists, I propose we solve the issue taking into account the interests of both parties. According to classified documents, the Russian Side is ready to conduct its own analysis and issue certificates or extracts which might be valuable for the U.S. Side.

Concerning Stalag III-C, it may be possible to find some additional information in some archives of the Federal Archival Agency ROSARKHIV. We are looking into this. I cannot be more specific at this time.

There is one request I have of you. It concerns point nine under "Requests made by the Russian Side" in the Joint Statement from the 20th Plenum. We are asking for correspondence of the office of the U.S. Military Attaché in the USSR on matters pertaining to coordinating the Allied Powers' operations in 1941-1945. I understand that this has no direct bearing on the work of our Commission, but may significantly help Russian historians in understanding the events of that period.

**Mr. Eastman:** It is in the Joint Statement signed by both our Chairmen. I will confer with Dr. Nenninger. I believe all the files are declassified and available at NARA.

**Dr. Nikiforov:** Thank you.

**Ms. Mikhajlova:** (Described the nature of the work performed by the Russian division of the International Red Cross.) I would like to ask for assistance in obtaining information about Soviet citizens liberated from German captivity by the U.S. Army. Some of them immigrated to the United States. So, the Russian division of the Red Cross is interested in having access to records of the U.S. Immigration Service for this matter. If possible, it would be good if there were a representative of the U.S. Immigration Service on the Commission.

**Mr. Eastman:** Is it possible for the Russian Side researchers who work in the office in Washington led by Maksim Alekseyev to do this research in the declassified records available at NARA?

**Ms. Mikhajlova:** Well, according to our regulations, the Russian division of the Red Cross should cooperate abroad with the Red Cross division of that foreign country.

**Dr. Nikiforov:** This can be a point for future discussion. For now, it is time to break and prepare for the closing session.

## **Korean War Working Group Session, 14:00-16:30, 21 February 2017**

### **Participants on the U.S. Side:**

- Colonel Christopher S. Forbes, USA, Director, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, DPAA
- Mr. Dan Baughman, Asia Pacific Directorate, Lead Analyst, Korean War Working Group, DPAA
- Major James H. Harvey, USA, Chief, Moscow Detachment, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, DPAA
- Dr. Vladislav Sorokin, Chief of Research, Moscow Detachment, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, DPAA
- DOS Interpreter

### **Participants on the Russian Side:**

- Colonel Andrey Tikhonov, Chief, 1st Department, Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense (TsAMO)
- Ms. Victoria Kayaeva, Chief, Mass Media Relations, TsAMO
- Dr. Alexander Shilin, Counselor, North American Department, Russian Foreign Ministry
- Dr. Andrey Pochtarev, Chief, Security Group of the Commission on POW/MIAs/Internees, and Special Department of Security Procedures, Directorate to Perpetuate the Memory of those Killed in the Defense of the Motherland

**Dr. Shilin:** We are prepared to work on Korean War issues. We plan to work until 16:30, then we will have a joint summary of the Tech Talks. This is my first time working with the Commission. I am filling in for Colonel Permyakov who has the flu. I am familiar with foreign wars and history so I was chosen to fill in today for the Korean War Working Group. In 2004, I started researching the Korean War and I have been involved with military history.

*Dr. Shilin then introduced Tikhonov and Kayaeva.*

As for the Plenum, we familiarized ourselves with the issues. We have done some preliminary work and are ready to engage with the U.S. Side.

**Mr. Baughman:** I too am substituting for another long time analyst – Danz Blasser. I did however, attend the 20th Plenum and worked on common issues. We have some documents to hand over today.

**Dr. Shilin:** We have the issues of the Soviet maps of North Korea, and the issue of giving access to Korean War documents regarding the 64th Fighter Aviation Corps. If you are not opposed, I suggest that we start with the 64th.

**Mr. Baughman:** Sure.

**Colonel Tikhonov:** The issue relating to the Marshal of Aviation Stepan Krasovskij Group [Air Force Operational Group] is an old issue. We are working on the declassification of this. This is being carried out according to regulation and in an orderly fashion. In the Main Staff of the Air Forces archives, documents do not pertain to specific topics or cases. We are aware of the interest in this issue, so the archives department received special orders to form a special department. Documents that belong to the Krasovskij Group have never been studied by anyone. A group is being formed that will be preparing them for public release. The Ministry of Defense level guidance group documents will be scanned and, if possible, made releasable to the public.

**Mr. Baughman:** Is there a timeline goal with the working group?

**Colonel Tikhonov:** There will be three stages. 1 February – 31 March, we'll take a look at ten *fondy* and publish them. We're working with the TsAMO Commission to declassify them. The third stage [there was no mention of stage two] will be completed by September and reported to the working group leader. We report to the head of the archives, and he in turn reports to the head of the archives division.

**Mr. Baughman:** Is this group the one headquartered in China? That is one level above the 64th.

**Colonel Tikhonov:** Reports of the 64th would go higher and are included in the Krasovskij files.

**Dr. Shilin:** According to point five from the Plenum, this is the issue of Factory 315.

*Colonel Taranov and Goncharenko then entered the room. Taranov explained that at 16:30 all personnel would move to the Negotiations Room. Before departing, Taranov stated that significant information regarding the Soviet maps would then be presented to the U.S. Side at 16:30.*

**Colonel Tikhonov:** We do not have any document at TsAMO regarding Factory 315.

**Mr. Baughman:** We will make mention of that with our Cold War Working Group members since Factory 315 concerns their work.

**Dr. Shilin:** Regarding the declassification of the 64th documents, we know that much work has been done regarding recoveries. Work began in 1993 under Boris Yeltsin and the Presidential Archives. Hundreds of documents, more than 300 pages, were transferred to the U.S. Side. This work has continued under the Russian and South Korean governments, [the Joint Russian-South Korean Study Group]. Information lies within North Korean and Chinese archives. I give the floor back to Tikhonov.

**Colonel Tikhonov:** Eighty-seven sub-unit *fondy* of the 64th exist at TsAMO. Fifty-eight aviation units, 1,394 files, 768 declassified, and 626 remain classified. Documents from air defense and communications units are also there. We have prepared 11 responses pertinent to

U.S. requests. The records remain classified although TsAMO and the Archival Service continue to try to declassify.

**Dr. Shilin:** The key request is the maps. We will present this at the closing today. We are prepared to answer the remaining Plenum questions from the U.S. Side. Regarding the Russian Side questions from the Plenum, the issue of U.S. advisors in South Korea, March-June 1950. Victor Gavrilov was probably the one that asked this question. Also, there is the issue of the Head of U.S. HQ Far East Command files in the Korean War.

*Colonel Forbes entered the room and joined the Korean War Working Group Technical Talks. Previously he had been in the Vietnam War Working Group for its opening.*

**Mr. Baughman:** By law, records in control of U.S. agencies must be retired to the National Archives after 50 years, including war records. There is also Executive Order 12958 of 1995, which calls for the review for declassification of Korean War-era documents. So, U.S. Advisory Group and Far East Command documents are at the National Archives and Records Administration (NARA) at College Park, MD, and are available for research by the public. Mr. Linnington, before he left, gave us instructions that we conduct a joint effort with Maxim [Alexeyev] and our researchers who know exactly how to do this. We will provide NARA finding aids to Maxim. There are no problems for Maxim in getting these documents. Maxim said that he wants monthly working group meetings and we can get him the finding aids at these meetings.

**Dr. Shilin:** You mean the documents we requested are open?

**Mr. Baughman:** Yes. The Far East Command files will be enormous. The Far East Command had subordinate Army level units, eight ground combat divisions, the 5th Air Force, and 7th Fleet/U.S. Navy Carrier Task Groups plus Marine Aviation. Generally these war records are available unredacted—for researchers to copy and scan without blacked out portions.

**Dr. Pochtarev:** Thanks for the Catalina and Elizabeth City information (WWII). We received many original documents. We understand that Vasilyev is likely buried in Belgium. We know the Elizabeth City information is incomplete, though. In the 1990s, large amounts of Korean War documents were declassified. In the 1990s we were always interested in U.S. and South Korean records regarding pre-war and post-war actions. We are interested in the planning documents from General McArthur and his possible nuclear options.

**Mr. Baughman:** The Far East Command documents have been declassified.

**Colonel Forbes:** I am not sure this question concerning General McArthur is relevant to the work of the Commission. I recommend that we stay focused on finding answers concerning our POWs and MIAs, and we should not venture into areas that are not pertinent to the Commission's charter.

**Dr. Shilin:** In Colonel Forbes' words, this is 'information related to the matter.'

**Dr. Pochtarev:** Let me explain. Research has guidelines. In the 1990s, we compiled a book, '*War in Korea: Documents and Records*'. In that work, we used a huge mass of documents that included U.S. records. When our experts combine their knowledge, it will produce a better result. Unfortunately, a large amount of documents in Russia are being classified for some reason.

**Colonel Forbes:** As Mr. Baughman said, in the U.S. these documents are declassified and available to any researcher that wants to access them. However, I reiterate that we should stay focused on finding answers concerning our POWs and MIAs. Thank you.

**Mr. Baughman:** I have got reports to provide for this meeting before we close. At the 20th Plenum, the Russian Side asked for the locations in which the U.S. recovered servicemen remains in North Korea from 1996 to 2005. Major Harvey provided that list in July 2016. The report included the number of graves and locations that were found. This report I am providing today is an update, we now have 20 additional identifications of remains that we have recovered in Unsan and the Chosin area from 2001 to 2005.

*Mr. Baughman provided the document to Dr. Shilin.*

This will continue to be updated.

**Dr. Shilin:** We will pass this along to the Russian Side experts who will continue that work.

**Mr. Baughman:** Our second document involves research by our Moscow staff, who in the past provided rosters of Soviet casualties in North Korea which they annotated while conducting research into the files of the 64th Fighter Aviation Corps on our own losses. Here is an updated roster of Soviet casualties we have noted from our research there.

*Mr. Baughman then provided Dr. Shilin the roster.*

*Mr. Baughman then provided Dr. Shilin with a letter from the 64th Fighter Aviation Group to the Main Staff of the Air Forces of the Soviet Army, which contained a list of personal items from U.S. Air Force MIA John Shewmaker.*

This last document is illustrative of the type of information we believe exists in the files of the Main Staff of the Soviet Air Forces. The document regards an F-84 pilot, John Shewmaker. We last saw him spinning out of control after air combat with MiGs over MiG Alley in 1951. The document is an inventory of material he had on his person. This document shows that Russia clearly knew something about his fate. This is the kind of document we want to show to the families.

**Dr. Shilin:** TsAMO has only documents, not artifacts or pictures.

**Colonel Forbes:** Who does have pictures?

**Dr. Shilin:** I do not know.

**Dr. Pochtarev:** In the 1990s, under General Zolotarev, the U.S. Side received many such documents [data plates]. We passed on all we had to the U.S. Side in the 1990s. Our guys could not keep or take anything.

**Colonel Forbes:** I saw artifacts at the Air Defense Museum in Balashikha. Would any of your museums have artifacts?

**Dr. Pochtarev:** All items were kept, studied, and tested, so, maybe there were artifacts there. The Moscow Aviation Institute dealt with this. [When] the USSR collapsed, things went missing. Some Russians have begun to collect such things. Survivors have been collecting Catalina artifacts. We would be very lucky to get such things from Russian people.

**Dr. Shilin:** Any other reports?

**Mr. Baughman:** No.

**Dr. Shilin:** Do you know of any questions for the 21st Plenum? TsAMO is loaded with work until September.

**Colonel Forbes:** Some things we need are in other archives. How do we get excerpts from GRU or KGB (FSB)?

**Dr. Shilin:** We have Commission members in such agencies already and good connections with these agencies.

**Colonel Forbes:** How many documents have we got from these agencies?

**Dr. Pochtarev:** Moscow requests are sent to the Russian Side and then on to any agency as needed.

**Colonel Forbes:** If we provide a detailed request, would it be sent to GRU and/or FSB?

**Dr. Pochtarev:** Yes.

**Dr. Shilin:** The narrower the request, the more specific the archives to which it gets sent.

**Colonel Forbes:** In September of last year while in Russia, I read a newspaper article about the Wallenberg case. In 1947, Wallenberg, a Swedish diplomat in Hungary, died in Soviet captivity. In 1957, the Soviets admitted that he died in their captivity. I am trying to establish a parallel. I read that after all these years, Russia has agreed to declassify KGB documents surrounding the Wallenberg case. I also read all of the Plenum notes, from the 1st through the 20th. We used to always ask you to declassify huge amounts of documents and files. Your answer has always

been 'No'. But, you would always advise us to submit specific cases and then you could assist. This is what we will do. I do not think that all of our answers are in TsAMO at Podolsk, but rather the answers we seek are in other archives. We will provide you focused cases and ask that you look wide across many of your archive holdings, KGB, Border Guards, GRU, and Presidential archives for example, and then redact, declassify, and release the pertinent documents or information. We could then lay these on the "Altar of Victory."<sup>1</sup> Mr. Tikhonov, is this possible?

**Dr. Shilin:** Today we mentioned 1,390 files were released, 330 pages per file. So, this is feasible, but work-intensive.

**Colonel Forbes:** If we gave you specific cases could you disseminate to *all* agencies and redact, declassify, and release pertinent documents or information?

**Colonel Tikhonov:** We will send requests to wherever needed. We have also done this with other countries. The Russian Side of the Commission will send requests wherever needed, the decree actually states this.

**Dr. Pochtarev:** Previously, the Commission pertained only to U.S. POW/MIA cases in Russia. In 1994, Russian POW/MIAs got added to the mission of the Commission. Wallenberg was arrested by counterintelligence abroad. He was kept in KGB prisons and died there. The Russian Side provided specific answers to the locations where U.S. personnel were interrogated.

**Dr. Shilin:** We need to close our working group session now. I would like to thank the U.S. Side for their work and say that we are committed to the idea that until the last soldier is buried, the war still goes on.

*End of official portion of breakout session, all attendees proceeded to the Negotiations Room for a summary of the Tech Talks. During the summary, General-Major Kirilin presented Dan Baughman with Soviet-made Korea Topographic Maps.*

---

<sup>1</sup> *Colonel Forbes and General-Colonel Vostrotin met at the Russian Federal Cemetery in Mytishchi, September 2016. During that meeting General-Colonel Vostrotin proposed for the U.S. Side to submit three cases and these cases will be laid at the 'Altar of Victory'.*

## **Cold War Working Group Session, 14:00-16:30, 21 February 2017**

### **Participants on the U.S. Side:**

- Dr. James G. Connell, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency (DPAA), Lead Analyst, Cold War Working Group, and Acting Executive Secretary, U.S. Side of the USRJC
- MSgt Scott A. Erwin, USAF, Researcher, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, DPAA
- DOS translator

### **Participants on the Russian Side:**

- Mr. Alexander Vladimirovich Lavrentyev, Member USRJC, Chairman of the Cold War Working Group, including Local Conflicts and Military Operations in Afghanistan (1979-1989), Deputy Director of the Warrior-Internationalist Committee of the Commonwealth of Independent States Heads of State
- Colonel (Ret) Andrey Taranov, Deputy Director, Russian MoD Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Fallen Defenders of the Motherland and Executive Secretary of the Russian Side of the USRJC
- Mr. Alexander Fedorovich Mukomolov, Member USRJC, Coordinator for the Northern Caucasus Region, President of the Inter-Regional Non-Governmental Organization “General Lebedev Peacekeeping Mission”
- Mr. Andrey Yevgenyevich Baranov, Korean War Working Group (1950-1953) subject-matter expert, Scientific Colleague of the Scientific-Research Institute of Military History of the General Staff of the Armed Forces of the Russian Federation.

**Dr. Connell:** It is a pleasure to be working with you, Alexander. I commend you for the work you have done over the years with General Aushev’s Committee attempting to account for Soviet MIAs from your war in Afghanistan. I have heard many complimentary things about you from our mutual friend, Vladimir Shebanov. With your permission, and because I know you may not be very familiar with the Cold War Working Group of the USRJC, I would like to provide you a brief context on our work.

**Mr. Lavrentyev:** That would be very useful.

**Dr. Connell:** Between 1950 and 1965, thirty-nine American reconnaissance aircraft were shot down over or near the border of the former Soviet Union. After 1965, with the advent of satellites the numbers of recon flights were greatly reduced. Of the 39 incidents, 30 resulted in the return of live crew members or the remains of the dead. The remaining nine cases have 126 missing crew members. In the 1990s, the U.S. admitted that these flights were indeed intelligence collection missions, and Russia admitted that all but two of the planes were shot down by Soviet pilots. In the past, the Russians have provided the names and last known locations of these pilots so that they could be interviewed by the U.S. Side. In general, they

knew very little about the fates of the crew members. They fired their missiles, returned to base, and were told nothing about the results. They would claim that they saw the planes explode and fall into the sea. We can presently verify that only one of the shoot downs occurred over land and that was the shoot down that occurred over Armenia. Of the ten Cold War cases we began work on in 1992, it is the only case considered to be closed. At the time of the shoot down, the Soviets returned the remains of five crew members, and then in 1993 an excavation operation was conducted and the remaining crew member's remains were found and identified via DNA analysis. Cognizant of the need to provide you with concrete details to facilitate additional archival searches we decided to concentrate on one of the nine incidents at this meeting. This is the U.S. Navy P2V that was shot down on 6 November 1951. The two Soviet pilots who were involved were Senior Lieutenants Lukashov and Shchukin (both deceased). Through archival research conducted by the late retired Rear Admiral Boris Gavrilovich Novyy, a valued consultant to the USRJC for seventeen years, we learned that both of these pilots were awarded the Order of the Red Banner for shooting down this aircraft. When they were summoned to their HQ, they both thought they were in serious trouble and were very surprised to be receiving medals. An article printed in "Krasnaya Zvezda" on 23 November 1951 announced the awards to the two pilots. Our research over the past 25 years has touched on the possibility that some of the air crewmen aboard these planes could have survived the crash and been picked up by the Soviet Border Guards cutters or navy ships. Some of our constituents believe that these surviving crew men could have ended up in the Soviet penal system without judicial process. We know that three pilots, whose planes had been shot down were imprisoned, but later returned. These pilots were Gary Powers, Bruce Olmstead, and John McKone. Bruce died in Annapolis last October at the age of 81. The Russian Side has stated that reports of survivors from the Cold War shoot downs other than these three *do not exist*. Your representatives have said that you have investigated the possibility that there were American survivors and that they were sent to the Gulag upon being captured, but found no such reports, and stated that it is a "long shot" that such reports exist. Our goal today is a candid discussion on avenues to investigate this very premise and determine if, perhaps, there may be archival sources we have overlooked in seeking to confirm... or discredit, such an eventuality. In the 1990s, I and other USRJC representatives visited the Pacific Fleet Archives which, at least at that time, was in a converted Lutheran church. In the early 2000s, Admiral Novyy returned to the archives in Vladivostok. After his visit, we requested access to the archives of the Pacific Fleet via direct correspondence through the Russian Side to the Chief-of-Staff of the various fleet archives. Only the Pacific Fleet in Vladivostok responded, and RADM Novyy worked in the Pacific Fleet Archives in 2005. These Archives along with the Border Guards archives are likely places where information might be found about losses of U.S. aircraft from the Cold War era that occurred at sea. While one might say that documents from 1951 should long ago have been transferred to the Central Archives of the Russian Navy in Gatchina, we all know how far it is from Vladivostok to St. Petersburg, and can imagine how much it costs to send a container containing sixty year-old documents by rail or ship the length of the Russian Federation. Is it possible that Commission researchers could again

visit the Pacific Fleet Archives and see if there is any additional information on this shoot down and possible survivors?

**Mr. Lavrentyev:** This is something that we can look into.

**Dr. Connell:** Several years ago, former Russian Side Executive Secretary Colonel Sergey Nikolayevich Osipov told U.S. family member Pat Lively Dickinson (the sister of a missing American from the Cold War) that photographs were taken of the downing of a U.S. aircraft in the region of Vladivostok on 6 November 1951. Based on this assertion, along with the fact that the Russian side provided the U.S. Side with gun camera photography of the downing of another U.S. aircraft on 2 September 1958, the former U.S. Cold War Working Group Co-Chairman, Mr. A. Denis Clift, was convinced that gun camera photography exists for all of the shoot downs that occurred in the Vladivostok region. Unfortunately, the Russian Side said that Russian archives hold no further gun camera photography. Do you have any ideas on where the Russian Side might accomplish a more detailed search for gun camera photography of the 6 November 1951 shoot down and provide that photography to the U.S. Side?

**Mr. Lavrentyev:** Again, we will do what we can.

**Dr. Connell:** Until 2003, Admiral Novyy worked in the Russian Border Guards Service Archives in Pushkino reviewing documents connected with the Cold War shoot downs of U.S. aircraft. If USRJC representatives were permitted to access the Border Guards Archives again, what are the prospects for finding additional information on the 6 November 1951 shoot down? We are sincerely looking for information that might clarify the fates of our missing servicemen. At this point, I would like for us to examine together the documents you have given us over the past 25 years related to the 6 November 1951 shoot down, and maybe we can identify new avenues of research. We provided copies of these documents as an attachment to our correspondence requesting we discuss this incident at these Technical Talks, but I also have copies I can provide now. Since you may not be familiar with them, I would like to present you with 27 pages of Russian-language documents dealing with this incident which we received from Russian archives in the nineties.

**Mr. Lavrentyev:** Do these documents directly refer to the case under discussion?

**Dr. Connell:** Absolutely. They have also been translated into English and shared with relatives of the missing.

**Mr. Lavrentyev:** It is striking how quickly the awards were given following the incident.

**Dr. Connell:** That is why the pilots were afraid that they had done something wrong. Do you think any of the pilots or other crew men could have survived the crash and then been put into the prison system without higher level officials knowing about this?

**Mr. Lavrentyev:** Absolutely not. The information that a U.S. plane was shot down would have gone directly to the top. Especially prior to the death of Joseph Stalin, anyone would have been terrified to have lied.

**Dr. Connell:** As I mentioned earlier, we have sent a formal request with these documents attached to the Russian Side with the question: Are there any other archival approaches that we can look into?

**Mr. Lavrentyev:** In preparation for assuming this role, I read the minutes of the last Plenum, and we discussed this case. Our experts have looked into this case, but they have no additional information at this time. However, we will continue working this case. Many agencies could have participated in the preparation of the documents and perhaps they have documents.

**Dr. Connell:** We asked General-Lieutenant Khristoforov [then Director of the Federal Security Service (FSB) Archives] at the Plenum in Washington if there was any group that could have transferred prisoners without the knowledge of the KGB.

**Mr. Lavrentyev and Mr. Mukomolov:** NO!

**Mr. Lavrentyev:** There would have been no reason to lie in the documents. There was a process in place to return those shot down and why would that process not have been followed?

**Dr. Connell:** We are presenting these documents to show what you have been able to give us in the past. Maybe this will help us determine what other archives we could look in. Most of us believe that the FSB archives should contain additional information.

**Mr. Taranov (who had entered the room earlier):** It appears that some of the documents [which had been passed to the Russian Side] came from the FSB (KGB) archives. Nothing would have been held back. Any crew men picked up would have been registered for medical care and food. This information would have gone to the highest level of authority. If any pilot had survived, it would have been reported to Stalin. They would have been taken care of and then returned. In my experience, nothing would have ever been kept back. We will look again, but chances are slim that anything else will be found.

**Dr. Connell:** I have been looking at these documents for 25 years, but we just want to try to tie up any loose ends. Do you think there are any other log books associated with this incident?

**Mr. Lavrentyev:** We will try to find out.

**Dr. Connell:** For your information, the next incident we plan to focus on will be the 13 June 1952 case.

**Mr. Mukomolov:** I am former KGB, and I can assure you that rumors would have been spread among the families of the pilots who shot down the planes.

**Dr. Connell:** Over the years, we have traveled to Vladivostok many times, and interviewed local inhabitants, but, maybe, it is time to start a new media campaign to see if anyone remembers the events.

**Mr. Lavrentyev:** We will continue to look, but I want to reiterate that no one would have lied to Stalin.

**Dr. Connell:** We thank you for your resolve to help us. The next topic of discussion is Factory 315. There are reports that the wreckage from the first Cold War shoot down on 8 April 1950 was taken to that factory. We know the last known location of the factory on Pravda Street in Moscow and would like to visit it.

**Mr. Lavrentyev:** That can be arranged on a future visit with proper notification.

**Dr. Connell:** We would also like to visit the PVO museum in Balashikha again and speak to museum director Yury Knutov there about Vietnam.

**Mr. Lavrentyev:** That can also be arranged.

**Dr. Connell:** I have always felt bad that we have not been able to help more in finding Soviet soldiers missing from Afghanistan. There was some success in the early days. Ludmilla Thorne, a Russian immigrant to the U.S., was instrumental in assisting to compile the list of missing Soviets. Currently, according to our information from Said Tulakov, with the “Afghantsy” organization in St. Petersburg, there are 264 names of missing Soviets.

**Mr. Lavrentyev:** This number is a good number. In the 1990s, many former Soviet soldiers missing from Afghanistan were found alive in other countries: Twenty-two returned home, and seven refused to come home. We found three alive in Afghanistan, but they had become completely assimilated with Afghan wives and families. The Red Cross has been very helpful in this effort. We met with the commanders who fought in Tora Bora and showed them pictures of Soviet soldiers: they recognized one soldier. Three Soviet prisoners were taken to Pakistan. The Russian Side would really like to talk to people who helped the Soviet soldiers get out of Afghanistan, because they might have information on other POWs. Last year, we found a former POW living in Toronto, who gave information on three other POWs. We would like to know about those Soviet soldiers who may be living in the U.S.

**Dr. Connell:** Do you have any specific names?

**Mr. Lavrentyev:** We do not. We think that they may have changed their names, and we would hope they would contact the Russian Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

**Dr. Connell:** Of course, we will help any way we can. Most of the help that we have provided in recent years has been reports from U.S. forces stationed in Afghanistan.

**Mr. Mukomolov:** I would like to raise the issue of the conflicts in the Northern Caucasus. This mainly consists of the wars that have been fought for the last 20 years: two conflicts in Chechnya, Ingushetia, and South Ossetia. There are 7,000 to 8,000 persons missing from these conflicts, however according to the official list there are only 326 Russian soldiers still missing from the Chechen conflicts. We are establishing a genetic database to help in this effort to identify casualties from the Chechen wars. The creation of this database is a Russian Ministry of Defense effort, and the database has approximately 1,500 reference samples. One of the main challenges in locating the missing was the existence of an elaborate slave market in the region. Many Russians were sold into slavery and then probably taken out of the country. There existed a slave price list based on the ranks of the individuals. Many Chechen rebels have fled Russia and are living abroad, and the Russian Side believes that these people have information concerning the burial sites of Russian soldiers. The Russians would be willing to share with them the burial sites of Chechens that the Russians are aware of. We have location information on people who fled, and we want to interview them. Is this an issue that could be approached via the USRJC? There are other countries whose citizens fought in Chechnya that may be interested in the remains.

**Dr. Connell:** What kind of information would be provided by the Russian Side?

**Mr. Mukomolov:** We have names, locations, some phone numbers, and some addresses.

**Dr. Connell:** This would need to be put into specific requests, and it would have to be discussed with our leadership.

**Mr. Mukomolov:** We are undertaking new steps in this endeavor: genetics, interviews abroad, and Chechen soil scans in an effort to find burial sites.

**Mr. Lavrentyev:** I want to emphasize that we are interested in the information that these individuals could provide and not their past actions. Now, I would like to mention once again the issue of our K-129 submarine, which sank in 1968. There is a new museum in Tula and the director is very interested in obtaining some artifacts or debris recovered during U.S. efforts to raise the wreckage.

**Dr. Connell:** To my knowledge, we have already shared everything that was recovered from the K-129 that could be shared, including the sub's bell and a video of the burial at-sea ceremony for six Soviet sailors, whose bodies were recovered by the U.S. Both of these items were returned to Russia by CIA Director Robert Gates in October 1992. The video is on the Internet, but when we asked a few years ago no one seemed to know what became of the bell. A photograph of a crew man named Vladimir Kostyushko taken in an engine room aboard the submarine was also found and returned. In 2007, U.S. Side representatives gave Russia's Pacific Fleet archive and museum in Vladivostok duplicate copies of all these formerly classified documents, including excerpts from the deck logs of the U.S. submarines Swordfish and Halibut. As I recall, all of this material was first given to the Russian Side in 1995. If you do not have these 98 or so pages of

materials, we can come up with them again. They also include information on incidents at sea where Soviet military personnel perished.

**Mr. Lavrentyev:** We are particularly interested in the excerpts from the Swordfish deck logs.

**Dr. Connell:** In these materials, we gave the Russian Side deck log excerpts for the Swordfish for 1-17 March 1968. You may recall that the K-129, to the best of our knowledge, was lost on International Women's Day, 8 March 1968. Next year will be 50 years, as hard as it is to believe. In any case, provide specific requests through our Moscow office and we will do what we can. It seems our time is up, and we need to return to the big hall for the closing session. At this point, I would like to thank you and the other officials who have served on the Russian Side of the USRJC over the past 25 years for all the information we have been able to gather in an attempt to clarify the fates of the young men who were serving their country so faithfully, both in Russia and in America.

**Mr. Lavrentyev:** And thank you very much for your hard work over many years. It has been a pleasure.

## Vietnam War Working Group Session, 14:00-16:30, 21 February 2017

### Participants on the U.S. Side:

- Colonel Christopher S. Forbes, USA, Director, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, DPAA
- Ms. Svetlana Shevchenko, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, Lead Analyst, Vietnam War Working Group, DPAA
- Ms. Irina Koryakina, Researcher, Moscow Detachment, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, DPAA
- DOS Interpreter

### Participants on the Russian Side:

- Colonel Eduard Paderin, Head of the Vietnam War Working Group, Director, the Archives Service of the Armed Forces of the Russian Federation
- Mr. Sergey Migulin, Subject-Matter Expert, Vietnam War Working Group, Research Officer, the War History Research Institute, the Military Academy of the Joint Staff of the Armed Forces of the Russian Federation
- Mr. Sergey Pokladov, Subject-Matter Expert, Vietnam War Working Group, Research Officer, the War History Research Institute, the Military Academy of the Joint Staff of the Armed Forces of the Russian Federation

**Colonel Paderin:** I propose that I listen to you, your questions. At the last meeting in Washington in 2016, everybody was defining the problem, but there was not much concrete. Your colleagues work at our Podolsk archives, but, basically, on Korea.

**Colonel Forbes:** Colonel Paderin, it is good to see you again and I appreciate the experts on the Vietnam War that you have assembled today. I would like to open by introducing Ms. Svetlana Shevchenko. She is our new senior analyst in JCSD serving as our technical lead for the U.S. Side's Vietnam War Working Group. Ms. Shevchenko, in addition to our analysts and historians within our Agency, is responsible for finding information on the fate of our Prisoners of War and Missing in Action from the Vietnam War. I know that much remains classified in your archives concerning the Vietnam War, but perhaps now is the time we begin to look into this war more closely. For this reason, we hope to re-energize the Vietnam War Working Group, and we hope that your technical experts and Ms. Shevchenko can get that started.

As discussed in September of last year, we have focused our Vietnam efforts with the Commission on 10 distinct shoot down cases. These cases were derived from our analysis of 356 excerpts the Russian Side provided us in 2001, 2002, and 2003. We specifically request that you relook these 10 cases and search for any additional information broadly, beyond just TsAMO. We request that you look into your KGB, GRU, Presidential and Ministry of Foreign Affairs files for any records concerning these shoot downs and the fates of their U.S. crew members. While we understand that you cannot declassify entire *fondy* [collections], we ask

that you redact, declassify, and release any documents or information that you can and provide them to us.

**Colonel Paderin:** Document No. 28-16 [Ten Cases on the Vietnam War forwarded to the Russian Side in 2010] has not made it to us (this is the first time I am seeing it). Maybe it's just a technical mix-up, let's not blame anybody.

**Colonel Forbes:** To whom can we send our requests on Vietnam? Should we send them directly to you?

**Colonel Paderin:** There was and is an established procedure: requests come through the Moscow office; let's stick with it. I was not the chairman for the Vietnam War Working Group, Didigov was, maybe the requests were sent to him. At this point we are beginning work with a clean slate.

**Ms. Shevchenko:** At the [20th] Plenum, a number of questions were discussed and there was a request made to give [you] as much concrete information as possible with more details, so that it would be easier for you to carry out the search. At present, we are talking about 1,617 MIAs from the Vietnam War. There are 1,261 in Vietnam, 300 in Laos, 49 in Cambodia, and seven in China. All of this information is contained in a file which I am leaving with you. Today, we are raising two issues in addition to those we have already given you.

Work on the Last Known Alive cases. Of the total number of 44 individuals, 21 were lost in North Vietnam, 17 in Laos, and six in Cambodia. Here is the detailed list for you.

In addition, we have very detailed information on who died in captivity for you. In other words, we are trying to help you help us.

Returning to the 20th Plenum, Colonel Forbes spoke about 356 U.S. shoot down incidents provided by the Russian Side. These episodes are reflected in three lists which were given to us in 2001, 2002, and 2003. We have a very thorough analysis in this folder carried out by our analysts. We could correlate our information with that forwarded by you. From this information, we identified ten cases and forwarded them to you in 2010, together with the translation into Russian. In 2010, we sent that information to you. We requested that you conduct a search and provide any information you might hold on these cases.

Our first question: would you know if there was any work carried out for that request? Are there any results of this work? In 2010, we discussed this request with Igor Permyakov, and then with Andrey Tikhonov. At that time, these ten cases were included in a group of 30 cases: ten on WWII, ten on Korea, and these ten Vietnam War cases.

**Colonel Paderin:** Unfortunately, I do not know anything at the moment about analysis of this work since in recent history we have not received such concrete issues. I have done no analysis

since I was not the chairman of this working group. Maybe the previous chairman carried out such work.

**Colonel Forbes:** Do you know who did to it? Who was before you? Perhaps you can reach out to him?

**Ms. Shevchenko:** In 2010, we asked Colonel Ilyenkov for the possibility to declassify the documents. After that, no one worked on those issues directly, as far as I know.

**Colonel Paderin:** The Vietnam theme has not been raised since 2013, when I became Director of the Archival Service [of the MoD].

**Colonel Forbes:** This is a request from 2010.

**Colonel Paderin:** During our preparation for the Plenum, we did not work on that issue. There were no such tasks, and Ilyenkov had already been long gone by then. Other people who had been working on that left as well, and there was no succession. Ilyenkov left and, maybe, the documents went with him. There is also a problem inherent in that in that working group, unfortunately, the composition of the group is not constant. But we are prepared to correct this situation and take this on, carry out the analysis, and speak with Permyakov and Tikhonov.

**Ms. Shevchenko:** I want to emphasize that we are not setting any demands. Our goal is to establish a constant working channel with you in order to transmit questions and receive answers to them.

**Colonel Paderin:** If this work has already been done previously, then there must be results. Even if the result was negative, it should exist. Unfortunately, at present we do not have that information.

**Colonel Forbes:** We understand that the work of this working group has not been distinguished by its activity over the past decade. In addition to Ms. Shevchenko, we will have another analyst in this group to assist her efforts. We also have analysts who are not seen, but do enormous work. And, as Sveta said, we don't want to lay blame, but to establish communication. Sveta is the senior analyst in the group, and, moreover, a specialist in international affairs, and does her work in an exemplary fashion. We want to know who is going to work with her. Not from time to time, but on a constant basis. These ten cases on Vietnam represent one of the priority tasks that was raised at the plenary session in May 2016. Are there any ways to get this information not only from TsAMO, but from the former KGB [FSB-Federal Security Service] Archives, the GRU [Main Intelligence Directorate] Archives, or from other places? What are the prospects for our work? Would it be possible to leave [redact] only information that is related to our MIAs, declassify it and provide to us?

**Colonel Paderin:** I have no intention of justifying the lack of activity by previous workers. It is possible that there is information in other archives as you noted. The specific characteristics of

this work dictates that documents could have been transferred to other agencies. Based on the experience of the Korean War, there are the evaluations of the combat environment, there are reports, but, in general, interrogation reports are not preserved in our MoD archives. With respect to flyers who became POWs, on the basis of declassified documents we can find documents dealing with property and personal items which were sent to the relevant organizations. Speaking of our future work, I can comment on declassification of documents. The documents we hold connected with the Vietnam War consist of about 113 files and all of them are secret or top secret. In the Krasovskij group, for example, there are classified documents and declassified documents, but with restrictions on access to these documents. They may contain official information such as personal data, personal mutual relationships, and official activity that we would not want to fall into the hands of third parties. I made a decision to create an internal six-person working group on Vietnam. Their duties will be to look at documents, but not necessarily to declassify them, but we ourselves are able to see the information. We will make electronic copies of the unclassified documents. We will make excerpts from the classified documents of only that information that is relevant to the given episode. This will permit us to avoid bringing in people from other agencies to declassify documents since this is a very lengthy process and, as a rule, leads to a negative outcome, since the specialists are examining a document in its entirety. The document as a whole can contain information that constitutes a state secret that is impossible to declassify. Looking at a concrete persona, we can resolve this problem. For the documents in our classified holdings, we created our own special group on Vietnam from among the experts who are in attendance here today and from TsAMO colleagues who will help out with technical matters. In accordance with your wishes, we will take the earliest cases from your list and then look at all the remaining documents we have. We will take our information and your documents and determine where we might be able to find documents in other archives. I will make requests if my level of authority will permit. If it will not, I will make the requests through General Vostrotin.

**Colonel Forbes:** We are seeking any pieces to the puzzle. It is important to us, for example, if a flyer perished and the Vietnamese buried him somewhere or did they take him as a live prisoner. That will help us conduct a search in the Vietnamese archives. Now that we have normalized relations with the Vietnamese, we are also looking for our missing in Vietnam as well. We are expecting a lot from the work of our Vietnam War Working Group. These are difficult issues, but I know that you are an honest and sincere person, and I highly value and respect you, one Soldier to another.

*Colonel Forbes departed the room and joined the Korean War Working Group Technical Talks that were already underway.*

**Ms. Shevchenko:** We settled on ten cases that were forwarded to you in 2010. In addition, there are eight other cases that we submitted in the past fall. One of these cases (Estochin) was also in the previous 10-case list so there are 17 cases in all. This is our answer to the leadership of the

archives to their request: give us something concrete! These seven cases are united in that they were all shoot downs in the region of Hanoi and allegedly, by SAMs (surface-to-air missiles).

**Colonel Paderin:** Do you have objective data that they were shot down by SAMs or is this just an assumption?

**Ms. Shevchenko:** We have documentary evidence that indicates they were shot down from the ground.

**Mr. Migulin:** We want to know the source. Is this just reminiscence, or is it a document? So that we can know in which direction we should work.

**Mr. Pokladov:** Archival documents lead to a dead end if they don't have archival citations. You need data. Where did the information come from? Do your documents contain the combat task which the pilot carried out? Then we can establish his route [of flight]. Did he come into Hanoi or did he fall on the way home? Is there any solid assurance what type of weapon shot the plane down? Was it Zenit missiles or Zenit artillery? If one cannot define the route from the submitted data [in the binder], then, please, in new requests, define it. We will take a look at our information, compare it with your data, invite the experts and plan our work.

**Ms. Shevchenko:** Let's go back to the ten cases that were transmitted to you previously. Is it possible for you to look at them and tell us what other information you need? We have 1,617 MIAs, and each case has a file that includes new information as the analysts obtain it.

**Mr. Pokladov:** An airplane can fly at an altitude of 200-300 meters because there are hills there, and he can't get over them. They shoot him down. With what? He burrows into the ground. Here is written 210th ZRP, but I say it was more likely destroyed by a Zenit missile launcher or artillery fire. It is desirable to have more detailed information on altitude and route. [Was the aircraft] enroute to the target or going away from it? It is easier for us to work on 1965 since the Russians were there.

**Ms. Shevchenko:** Can you tell us now what additional information you need for each case?

**Colonel Paderin:** We will invite experts, additional subject-matter specialists, analysts, we will check, we will discuss. We have a different system.

**Ms. Shevchenko:** We had a situation in which we showed a map to a veteran and he said: no, that is not the place and then he showed us the actual location of the shoot down, where later we found the remains. What kind of data do we need to give you for each case? The route, altitude, what else? One list we gave you was of the Last Known Alive cases. A second was a list of those who were seen in captivity. Give you a list of losses by year? For example, give you all the losses in the year 1965? The type of plane, the coordinates of the shoot down based on our information? You have asked to separate the losses over land from those over water? We have about 200 cases of losses over water.

**Mr. Pokladov:** Why did you choose precisely these ten cases? Because the relatives are very old and could well die still waiting for information? What is the principle you use for choosing? What is the logic of your request?

**Ms. Shevchenko:** This is based on the information we received from you. We did a correlation with your documents and with documents received from Vietnam. Your information is very valuable, but unfortunately, it did not help to locate the place - where do we look for the pilot and conclude what happened to him? Did he die in the crash? We are interested in where his remains lie. If you propose another approach for submitting our request and exactly what information to include, please tell us what would be easier for you.

**Mr. Pokladov:** This is very complex. There remain almost no witnesses. Only Khyupenen remains alive. Kolesnik, as well. There are certain periods of the war when Soviet forces, in the main, fought, then it was the Vietnamese who fought. Did Vietnamese follow our procedure in the reporting system? When I served in the Zenit missile forces there was a defined inventory form, that is, I had to fill out an artillery card where the targets were enumerated that was attached to a unified system of coordinates. And there was a second schematic showing where the airplane was located on the map. We were very rigidly held to account at this first stage; I don't know about the Vietnamese.

**Ms. Shevchenko:** What period are we talking about? 1965-1966?

**Colonel Paderin:** We have discussed [the matters] and we will determine now the way ahead.

**Ms. Shevchenko:** I am giving you a binder. Here is a listing of airplanes which were shot down. These lists were received from TsAMO in 2001, 2002, and 2003. Here is the analysis based on those lists that you gave us. Our Moscow office will translate those parts which are in English and transmit them to you.

**Colonel Paderin:** Things are complicated by the fact that our outgoing correspondence is retained for only 3-5 years, and we may not be able to find relevant correspondence. Letters which were sent by us are preserved as a document 3-5 years, and then they are destroyed. That means that we have to look for everything again. Send us all the documents through the Moscow office.

**Colonel (Ret) Taranov:** I will get in touch with Zolotarev, Filipov, and Mukhin, and we will try to clarify where they got the information which was transmitted to you [Shevchenko asked for the sources of information that was the basis for the three shoot down lists].

**Ms. Shevchenko:** Maybe it could be possible to look at Marshal Batitsky's books, his training manuals for Soviet Air Force students. They were a series of books published by the GRU. There are lots of brief descriptions of shoot downs of [American] planes in Vietnam, together

with the schematics of air combats, but that was it. Maybe the sources used for these manuals had information on U.S. pilots (captured, wounded, dead, buried, etc.).

**Mr. Migulin:** We need original sources: fond [archival collection number - SS], file, page... such and such a year. In addition, we need newspaper articles. Plus whatever memoirs are available. The case builds itself up. Any data; the events are important and have significance.

**Mr. Pokladov:** Shot down in aerial combat. Air-to-air missile. There is no algorithm. We need everything from the beginning: data, location, archives, coordinates of the locale, then bring everything together. This is not our priority work. They brought us in as experts, but we have a lot of other work. Do the Vietnamese give information? Have you found anybody? Do you collect DNA from the families?

**Ms. Shevchenko:** Every month our informational site is updated. The relatives have given DNA samples. They are stored in the laboratory.

**Colonel (Ret) Taranov:** It is not necessary to translate names into Russian. You should translate the search information.

**Mr. Migulin:** If there is information on interrogations, the FSB would have it.

**Colonel (Ret) Taranov:** As a rule, the FSB Archives would not hold information on the armed forces. Unfortunately, this is a fact. Such information could be anywhere, but not there. And we find these documents in any archives, but not there. One can find information in TsAMO, in the navy archives, in the medical archives, for that matter in the State Archives of the Russian Federation (GARF), where it should be. But we will check in any case there as well.

**Ms. Shevchenko:** In 2008 we conducted negotiations with TsAMO, the military medical archives, and the Russian State Military Archives. Irina Pushkaryova compiled a list of unclassified finding guides; it was proposed that the Russian archivists would review classified documents, redact them (leaving only the information on the American POWs and MIAs), declassify and provide to us. The agreement was approved on all levels, excluding the final one. But it is quite possible this information (selected finding guides) still remains in those archives. At TsAMO, Andrey Tikhonov said that part of the documents on Vietnam was there, but part was in Moscow. Where they are in Moscow, we do not know.

**Colonel (Ret) Taranov:** We will check. Maybe there are some results somewhere.

**Mr. Pokladov:** It is necessary to make a data base for each case.

**Ms. Shevchenko:** We have one.

**Mr. Pokladov:** Give us your info on all 1,600 persons. That way it will be simpler to find somebody. Do I come to TsAMO and say, what do you have on Vietnam? Aha, here is the report of such and such a regiment for 18 March 1966. A data base, preferably in chronological

order: type of airplane, the crew, military mission, route. I am consulting with you now, but it seems to me that this is the right way.

**Colonel Paderin:** Chronology is important. By date. Simply 10 plus 8 flyers does not give us anything. But if we have 1,600 persons and the year 1965, we can look in the archives, compare, and proceed further with the analysis. If a pilot was captured, we can find the leads. But, more likely, the Vietnamese have that. We may have documents that accompany these events.

**Ms. Shevchenko:** We have information on those who were alive the last time they were seen. If a person died in captivity, where was he buried?

**Mr. Migulin:** An unknown grave.

**Mr. Pokladov:** We need to know the altitude of the plane, its route, combat mission, the site it was supposed to strike, whether it was returning from the mission or on the way to the target, and the point where it fell (assumedly), all attached to the map. For example, point where it fell is unknown (if that is the case). Any supplementary information of the final flight is important. Let the analysts add this if it exists.

**Ms. Shevchenko:** Are the documents in your archives stored chronologically? Thematically?

**Colonel Paderin:** No. By *fondy* [collections]. Documents are not stored thematically. Even the documents on Vietnam are not stored in one place. They are arranged by regiment, by division, by army. We need the chronology in order to know where a certain unit was located to begin the search.

**Ms. Shevchenko:** Do you have any data which is openly accessible? What were the units and special units in Vietnam?

**Colonel Paderin:** Operational groups were created. It is our task to find out where, to find the chronology. Have you worked through open sources?

**Ms. Shevchenko:** We have analyzed the memoirs of Soviet veterans, mostly books and articles by Kolesnik's group. We need archival materials that provide much more reliable information. The veterans provide information, in some cases even diaries or excerpts from diaries. Veterans remember much and tell much but how precise are these stories?

**Ms. Shevchenko:** One more question. We learned that the military Order of the Red Banner Order was awarded to those who shot down an aircraft (among other deeds). Maybe we could find the awardees among the veterans and talk to them? Maybe they know anything about the fate of the pilots?

**Colonel Paderin:** In the medal citation, there is no information on what the award was given for (all the more if it was for shooting down an aircraft). It might be noted that there was a shoot down, but there will absolutely never be a description of the concrete event.

**Mr. Pokladov:** The first shoot down is known: who, what, how it was shot down. That was on the Day of Vietnamese Aviation. And what became of those pilots? Konstantinov is a pilot and lives in Tver; he could know a lot. He shot down one of the first aircraft. He was in combat, a navigator. If he has not been interviewed, he should be.

**Ms. Shevchenko:** One more thing, Soviet Spetsgruppy [Special Groups], experts who were given access to the place where the aircraft was shot down. They were supposed to write relevant reports. They must have known what happened to the pilot. Where can such reports be found? The special group was composed of only about 40 persons, but in 2008 now only three were still living, as far as I know from the open sources. Their reports would be extraordinarily important for us.

**Mr. Pokladov:** To whom were those groups subordinated? To the GRU? Was it a composite group? Were those reports generalized? At that time, technology there was important. The information on the pilots was probably compiled in different reports. We can look, maybe somewhere this information will surface.

**Ms. Shevchenko:** Before departure, I looked through the report from the 11th Plenum in 1994. There were four point of interest at that time, including the one on transfer of the American POWs to the USSR and contacts of the Soviet officials with American POWs in Vietnam. At present, the most important issue is what information from the Russian archives can help determine the fates of the pilots and locate their burial places.

**Colonel Paderin:** Were American POWs transferred to the USSR? I don't think so. There was no reason to.

**Ms. Shevchenko:** I would like to thank you for a most productive meeting and express hope for fruitful work. I will forward to our Vietnam War analysts your conclusions on what specific information needs to be included in our requests. We will also transmit, through our Moscow office, the missing translations of the materials in the binder as soon as possible.

## **Closing Session, 16:30-17:15, 21 February 2017**

### **U.S. Side Participants:**

- Colonel Christopher Forbes, USA, Director, Eur/Med Regional Directorate, DPAA
- Dr. James Connell, DPAA, Acting Executive Secretary of the U.S. Side, Cold War Working Group
- Mr. Henry Eastman, DPAA, WWII Working Group
- Mr. Daniel Baughman, DPAA, Korean War Working Group
- Ms. Svetlana Shevchenko, DPAA, Vietnam War Working Group
- Major James Harvey, DPAA, Chief, Moscow Detachment
- MSgt Scott Erwin, DPAA, Logistics Senior Noncommissioned Officer
- Dr. Vladislav Sorokin, DPAA Moscow Detachment, Chief Researcher
- Mr. Mikhail Smolyaninov, DPAA Moscow Detachment, Researcher
- Ms. Irina Koryakina, DPAA, Moscow Detachment, Researcher

### **Russian Side Participants:**

- General-Colonel Valeriy Vostrotin, Co-Chairman, USRJC
- General-Major (Ret) Alexander Kirilin, Deputy Co-Chairman, USRJC
- Colonel (Ret) Andrey Taranov, Executive Secretary of the Russian Side
- Dr. Nikolay Nikiforov, USRJC, Head of WWII Working Group
- Dr. Yelena Tsunayeva, USRJC, WWII Working Group
- Colonel Eduard Paderin, USRJC, Head of Vietnam Working Group
- Mr. Alexander Lavrentyev, USRJC, Head of Cold War Working Group
- Mr. Alexander Mukomolov, USRJC, North Caucasian Region
- Ms. Iolanta Mikhailova, USRJC, Russian Red Cross

### **Other Participants from the Russian Side:**

- Vladlen Epifanov, Liaison Officer, Russian Ministry of Foreign Affairs
- Alexander Shilin, Liaison Officer, Russian Ministry of Foreign Affairs
- Sergey Lipatov, Subject-Matter Expert, WWII Working Group
- Vladimir Fesenko, Subject-Matter Expert, WWII Working Group
- Andrey Baranov, Subject-Matter Expert, Korean War Working Group
- Victor Gavrilov, Subject-Matter Expert, Korean War Working Group
- Andrey Tikhonov, Subject-Matter Expert, Korean War Working Group
- Victoria Kayaeva, Subject-Matter Expert, Korean War Working Group
- Andrey Pachtarev, Subject-Matter Expert, Korean War Working Group
- Alexander Voronovich, Subject-Matter Expert, Vietnam War Working Group
- Sergey Migulin, Subject-Matter Expert, Vietnam War Working Group
- Sergey Pokladov, Subject-Matter Expert, Vietnam War Working Group

- Vladimir Popov, Chief, Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Fallen Defenders of the Fatherland, Ministry of Defense
- Yuri Kargin, Chief, International Section, Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Fallen Defenders of the Fatherland
- Igor Goncharenko, Consultant, Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Fallen Defenders of the Fatherland
- Maria Ksenofontova, Senior Specialist, Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Fallen Defenders of the Fatherland
- Elena Gritsenko, Senior Archivist, Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Fallen Defenders of the Fatherland

*Colonel Taranov narrated a slide show about the Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Fallen Defenders of the Fatherland. Colonel Taranov highlighted the activities of their organization.*

**General-Major (Ret) Kirilin:** I spoke with General-Colonel Vostrotin, and he wanted me to express his thanks for your participation in today's meetings. He hopes that tomorrow's activities will be interesting and informative. They have invested a lot of money in the building of Patriot Park. Today, I would like to give Mr. Dan Baughman the Korean War maps per your request. (Hands disk of the Soviet Korean War maps to Mr. Dan Baughman).

**Colonel Forbes:** I would like to extend a heartfelt thank you for these maps. It is a huge victory, and we can close the circle on this. We can locate villages that we had difficulties locating in the past due to changes in the names of these villages. We will report back to you on our success thanks to these maps. We also would like to present to you a video that highlights the activities of our Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency (DPAA). (Colonel Forbes presents the DVD to General Kirilin).

End Closing Session.