

**U.S.-Russia Joint Commission on POW/MIAs**

**21<sup>st</sup> Plenum**

**November 8, 2017**

**Moscow, Russian Federation**

**Compendium of Summarized Minutes**

**Compendium of Summarized Minutes  
Table of Contents**

<b>Opening Session</b>	<b>Page 3</b>
<b>World War II Working Group</b>	<b>Page 7</b>
<b>Korean War Working Group</b>	<b>Page 18</b>
<b>Cold War Working Group</b>	<b>Page 30</b>
<b>Vietnam War Working Group</b>	<b>Page 37</b>
<b>Closing Session</b>	<b>Page 44</b>

**SUMMARIZED MINUTES**  
**21<sup>st</sup> Plenum**  
**U.S.-Russia Joint Commission on POW/MIAs (USRJC)**  
**Opening Session**  
**November 8, 2017**  
**Moscow, Russian Federation**

**U.S. Side Participants:**

- General Robert H. “Doc” Foglesong, USAF (ret.)  
U.S. Chairman, USRJC
- Mr. Kelly K. McKeague  
U.S. Commissioner to the USRJC representing the Department of Defense  
U.S. Chairman, USRJC Vietnam War Working Group  
Director, Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency
- Mr. Timothy C. Shea  
U.S. Commissioner to the USRJC representing the Defense Intelligence Agency  
U.S. Chairman, USRJC Cold War Working Group  
Defense Intelligence Officer for Europe/Eurasia
- Dr. Timothy K. Nenninger  
USRJC Commissioner to the USRJC representing the U.S. National Archives and  
Records Administration  
U.S. Chairman, USRJC World War II Working Group
- Colonel Christopher S. Forbes, USA  
Acting U.S. Chairman, USRJC Korean War Working Group  
Director, Europe Mediterranean Regional Directorate  
Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency
- Dr. James G. Connell, Jr.  
Acting Executive Secretary, U.S. Side of the USRJC  
Senior Researcher, Joint Commission Support Division  
Europe Mediterranean Regional Directorate  
Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency

**Russian Side Participants:**

- Colonel General Valeriy Aleksandrovich Vostrotin (ret.)  
Russian Chairman, USRJC  
Chairman of the Union of the Russian Paratrooper Veterans
- General Major Aleksandr Valentinovich Kirilin (ret.)  
Russian Deputy Chairman, USRJC

Assistant Deputy Minister of Defense

- Colonel Andrey Leonidovich Taranov (ret.)  
Russian Commissioner, USRJC  
Executive Secretary, Russian Side of the USRJC  
Deputy Director, Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Those Fallen in Defense of the Motherland, Ministry of Defense of the Russian Federation
- Colonel Eduard Arkadevich Paderin  
Russian Commissioner, USRJC  
Deputy Russian Chairman, USRJC Vietnam War Working Group  
Chief, Archival Service of the Ministry of Defense of the Russian Federation
- Colonel Igor Albertovich Permyakov (ret.)  
Russian Commissioner, USRJC  
Deputy Russian Chairman, USRJC Korean War Working Group  
Chief, Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense of the Russian Federation
- Colonel Nikolay Ivanovich Nikiforov (ret.)  
Russian Commissioner, USRJC  
Russian Deputy Chairman, USRJC WWII Working Group  
Deputy Chief for Scientific Research, Institute of Military History  
Military Academy of the General Staff of the Russian Armed Forces
- Mr. Aleksandr Fedorovich Mukomolov  
Russian Commissioner, USRJC  
Russian Deputy Chairman, Cold War Working Group  
Chairman, Inter-Regional Peacekeeping Mission Named after General Lebed
- Ms. Iolanta Vitol'dovna Mikhailova  
Russian Commissioner, USRJC  
Director, Nongovernmental Organization "Search and Information Center" of the Public Organization "Russian Red Cross" (NGO)
- Dr. Pavel Vasil'evich Pinchuk  
Russian Commissioner, USRJC  
Chief, 111th Main State Center of Forensic Pathology, Russian Ministry of Defense
- Dr. Yelena Moiseevna Tsunaeva  
Russian Commissioner, USRJC  
Executive Secretary, All-Russian Public Organization "Search and Recovery Movement of Russia" (NPO)
- General Major Vladimir Vasil'evich Popov (ret.)  
Director, Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Those Fallen in Defense of the Motherland, Ministry of Defense of the Russian Federation

- Chief, Washington Office, Russian Side of the USRJC
- Korean War Subject Matter Expert  
Department Chief, Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense of the Russian Federation
- WWII Subject Matter Expert  
Senior Researcher, Research Institute of Military History  
Military Academy of the General Staff of the Russian Armed Forces
- Subject Matter Expert, Cold War and the War in Afghanistan  
Chief, International Department, Warriors-Internationalists Committee, Council of Heads of States, Commonwealth of Independent States
- Deputy Director, Department of North America,  
Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation
- Advisor, Department of History and Records  
Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation
- Member of the Council, Russian Association of Afghan Veterans  
Member, Executive Council of “Battle Brotherhood” All-Russian Public Organization

General Vostrotin as the Host and Chairman of the Russian Side of the USRJC (aka “the Commission”) welcomed all the participants to the Opening Session of the USRJC’s 21<sup>st</sup> Plenum and introduced the Russian participants. Among his opening comments, General Vostrotin commented on:

- The success of the Commission’s visit the previous day (November 7) to the Museum of the Air Defense Forces in Balashikha;
- The Parade held the previous day in honor of the Parade held in 1941<sup>1</sup> and the shared triumph over Nazi Germany in World War II;
- The ongoing digitization of Soviet military records;
- The work of the Russian Ministry of Defense’s Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Fallen Defenders of the Motherland to search for graves of Russian servicemen buried in the United States. Over the past two years, the work of this organization with the cooperation of DPAA, has found 139 graves of Russian

---

<sup>1</sup> While the Soviet Union existed, the parade held on this day was in honor of the Great October Revolution that occurred on October 25, 1917, using the Julian calendar. Once the modern Gregorian Calendar was adopted by Soviet Russia, this holiday maintained its name but was moved forward to November 7. In 1941, the Great October Revolution parade occurred as the Battle of Moscow was being fought a few miles away. Soldiers who participated in the parade were actually marching to the front via Red Square. In post-communist Russia, November 7 is now celebrated in honor of the 1941 Parade as a substitution for the October Revolution parade. U.S. Delegation members who did not go to the Museum of the Air Defense Forces were invited to view the parade.

servicemen in California, New York, Maryland, and Virginia. Most recently, two additional grave sites were discovered in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania;

- The success of negotiations to erect a monument in Elizabeth City, NC, to Soviet, Canadian, and U.S. servicemen that participated in Operation Zebra<sup>2</sup> during WWII;

Even though this is a very difficult time in the relations between our countries, General Vostrotin hopes that we will continue our very important work. Further, he believes that we have found the ideal way to conduct Commission business. He envisions that the bulk of our work will be conducted throughout the year at technical talk sessions between subject matter experts and not during plenary sessions. He believes plenary sessions should be reserved for both sides to present, discuss, and document the results of the Commission's efforts and plan for future events.

Finally, General Vostrotin commented that this is the first time in the 26-year history of the Commission that veterans' and family organizations from both sides have participated in a Commission Plenum. He welcomes this participation and the influence these organizations bring to the table and hopes this arrangement will continue. General Vostrotin turned the floor over to General Foglesong and invited his comments.

General Foglesong thanked General Vostrotin, greeted the member of the Russian delegation and thanked the Russians for their help and hospitality during the previous day's events. In his opinion he remarked, that the Commission is enjoying an unprecedented level of enthusiasm and motivation on both sides. He introduced the members of the U.S. Side.

Among his opening comments, General Foglesong commented:

- He agreed completely with the plan presented by General Vostrotin for detailed discussions between experts throughout the year at technical talks and reserving Plenums to discuss these results. He believed that we may have found the ideal solution to advance our work;
- He thanked the Russian Side for allowing Mr. Bob Wallace, representing the Veterans of Foreign Wars, and Ms. Ann Mills-Griffiths, representing the National League of POW/MIA Families, to participate today. He believed participation by such veterans and family organization will assist greatly in furthering the work of the Commission and agreed with General Vostrotin that this arrangement should continue;
- General Foglesong agreed that the USRJC must continue to transcend politics between the two countries and continue its mission that is humanitarian in nature.
- Finally, General Foglesong suggested a planning session to establish a regular annual schedule of four Technical Talks and one Plenary Session for the next decade.

---

<sup>2</sup> Operation Zebra was set-up to train Soviet airman to operate Catalina flying boats during WWII. Once they were trained, they then flew the planes to the Soviet Union as a part of the lend-lease program. A number of men perished during this activity.

**SUMMARIZED MINUTES**  
**21<sup>st</sup> Plenum**  
**U.S.-Russia Joint Commission on POW/MIAs (USRJC)**  
**World War II Working Group (WWIIWG) Talks**  
**November 8, 2017**  
**Moscow, Russian Federation**

**U.S. Side Participants:**

- Dr. Timothy K. Nenninger  
USRJC Commissioner to the USRJC representing the U.S. National Archives and  
Records Administration  
U.S. Chairman, USRJC World War II Working Group
- Senior Research Analyst, World War II Working Group  
Europe Mediterranean Regional Directorate  
Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency
- Research Analyst, World War II Working Group  
Europe Mediterranean Regional Directorate  
Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency

**Russian Side Participants:**

- Colonel Nikolay Ivanovich Nikiforov (ret.)  
Russian Commissioner to the USRJC  
Russian Chairman, USRJC WWII Working Group  
Deputy Chief for Scientific Research, Institute of Military History  
Military Academy of the General Staff of the Russian Armed Forces
- Ms. Iolanta Vitol'dovna Mikhailova  
Russian Commissioner to the USRJC  
Director General, Nongovernmental Organization (NGO) "Search and Information  
Center," Public Organization "Russian Red Cross"
- Dr. Yelena Moiseevna Tsunaeva  
Russian Commissioner, USRJC  
Executive Secretary, All-Russian Public Organization "Search and Recovery  
Movement of Russia" (NPO)
- Senior Researcher  
Research Institute of Military History  
Military Academy of the General Staff of the Russian Armed Forces

**Old Business Discussed During the 21<sup>st</sup> Plenum**

## 1. Possible U.S. Bomber on Bering Island

Background: The issue of a possible U.S. bomber that crashed on Bering Island near Kamchatka was raised at the 20<sup>th</sup> Plenum in Washington, D.C., in May 2016. It first came up in March 1995 when the U.S. Side received a letter from Boris Adrianovich Shkolin who was a retired Russian Merchant Marine officer living in Vladivostok. The U.S. Side provided the Russian Side with a copy of the letter.

In 1951, Mr. Shkolin was the captain of a merchant ship that delivered supplies to remote locations near Kamchatka. In December 1951, he was delivering provisions to Bering and Mednij Islands of the Komandorskiye Islands in the Bering Sea. On New Year's Eve of 1951-1952, Shkolin was celebrating with the commander of the Bering Island coast guard detachment in Nikol'skoe.

This officer told Shkolin that an American bomber crashed in one of the lakes on Bering Island during the summer of 1944. The American bomber, which Shkolin believes to have been a B-26 from the description he heard, was damaged by Japanese fighters and air defense guns on Paramushir Island and ultimately crashed on Bering Island.

In September 2016, the U.S. Side sent a written request to the Russian Side asking that they contact local residents of Bering Island for information that may corroborate Shkolin's account. The U.S. Side suggested that the Border Guards outpost on the island, if it still exists, may be a good place to start.

21st Plenum Discussions: Colonel Nikiforov expressed his understanding of this issue and stated that they had sent a request to the Border Guards on this case, but unfortunately, they have not received any positive answers to the request. Among the local residents, apparently no one remains that is historically connected to this event.

The Russian Side agreed to send a request to the local government and administration on Bering Island inquiring about information on this possible U.S. bomber.

The U.S. Side addressed the possibility of several other crash sites of U.S. aircraft in the Russian Far East. However, it is not easy to pinpoint where a missing aircraft may have crashed. The Russian side understands there are possible other sites and asks that any new information should be shared in order that this information be incorporated into their work.

The U.S. Side will provide a list of U.S. missing aircraft in the Far East region of Russia.

## 2. USS *Herring* (SS-233)

Background: On May 16, 1944, the USS *Herring* departed Pearl Harbor on her eighth and final war patrol and headed for the Kuril Islands. On June 1, 1944, the *Herring* attacked two merchant ships anchored near Matua (also known as Matsuwa) Island. A Japanese shore battery detected the submarine and opened fire, reportedly scoring two direct hits on the conning tower. Japanese records obtained after the war revealed that



the USS *Herring* sank two kilometers south of Point Tagan, Matua Island. The submarine went down with 83 men on board.

In September 2011, a Russian civilian diver claimed to have found the USS *Herring*.

In May 2016 during the 20<sup>th</sup> Plenum of the USRJC, the Russian Side stated that they would conduct search work for the USS *Herring* later in the summer of 2016. Weather conditions precluded the planned search work. However, in June 2017, the Russian Navy did conduct an investigation of the site where the USS *Herring* reportedly sank. The Russian Side notified the U.S. Side that it found a cigar-shaped object with a raised center section 2.5 km from Cape Yurlov on Matua Island. There is no confirmation yet that this is indeed the USS *Herring*.

21st Plenum Discussions: To ensure a full understanding of the circumstances surrounding the loss of the USS *Herring*, Colonel Nikiforov asked if there was any further information.

The U.S. Side stated that during the past year the U.S. Side did obtain a document recovered from Japanese archives. The document is a report from Japanese Combat Screening Unit 153 stating that they believe they hit the target [USS *Herring*], that it is unable to move underwater, and that they have no confirmation that it is destroyed.

The U.S. Side will provide the Japanese document to the Russian side.

### **3. Soviet Servicemen Missing in Norway: Captain-Lieutenant S.I. Kovalenko, Senior Lieutenant E.I. Frantsev, and Lieutenant Colonel B.P. Syromyatnikov**

Background: During the March 2017 Technical Talks held in Washington, D.C., the Russian Side made a request for assistance in researching the fates of three Soviet officers from World War II who went missing in Norway. They are Captain-Lieutenant S.I. Kovalenko, and two pilots, Senior Lieutenant E.I. Frantsev and Lieutenant Colonel B.P. Syromyatnikov. The two pilots went missing off the coast of Northern Norway in 1944. Kovalenko was a submariner captured in 1942 and taken by the Germans to a POW camp in Norway. The U.S. Side agreed to conduct a search of U.S. archives for information on these officers.

21st Plenum Discussions: Colonel Nikiforov requested an update on this issue. The U.S. Side reported that the search to date has not yielded any information and agreed to continue its search for information.

Colonel Nikiforov described in general a case that his office researched for a family member. They searched for many years, and the result was not what was hoped for. Nonetheless, they were able to answer the family. He stressed that even though the answers we provide may not always be positive, it still brings closure to the families, and this speaks to the importance of the Commission's work.

The U.S. Side agreed to continue searching for information on these missing Soviet

servicemen.

#### 4. First Lieutenant John Gerard McCarthy, USAAF

Background: This case was discussed during the Technical Talks in Moscow in February 2017. 1LT John Gerard McCarthy, USAAF, served as the pilot of a P-51D Mustang, tail number 44-13453, assigned to the 5<sup>th</sup> Fighter Squadron, 52<sup>nd</sup> Fighter Group, and 15<sup>th</sup> Air Force, based in Madna, Italy. On August 4, 1944, the 15<sup>th</sup> Air Force sent over 70 P-38 fighter-bombers and P-51 fighter aircraft from Madna, Italy, to attack two airfields near the town of Focsani, Romania, in support of Operation FRANTIC.

According to the mission report, the P-51s were supposed to escort the P-38s on ingress, over the targets, and during egress, while the latter would strafe their targets. The P-51s were then to head to their recovery base in Piryatin, Ukraine, USSR. On that day, 1LT McCarthy was in a flight of four P-51s, led by 1LT Schumacher, which became separated from its squadron. Schumacher decided to head for the recovery base at Piryatin.

At about 1150 hours, Schumacher sighted a large river, which he thought was the Dnepr River near Kremenchug. The formation came under attack from intense and accurate anti-aircraft artillery (AAA) fire. Schumacher initially believed that this AAA fire was from the Russians at the Kremenchug area, as the group was flying northwest to Piryatin. In fact, Schumacher's group was flying over the German-Soviet battle line along the Dniester River at the Ukraine-Moldova border in the direction of Chisinau (Kishinev).

According to Schumacher, at 1220 hours, about one kilometer northwest of Malaesti, in present-day Moldova (Transnistria), McCarthy's tail section broke off in mid-air, causing his aircraft to go straight into the ground and explode. This was the last known information on 1LT McCarthy, until December 2016.

At that time, U.S. Side researchers went to the Russian Ministry of Defense website "Pamyat Naroda" (Memory of the People) to determine which Soviet units were operating in the area of Malaesti when 1LT McCarthy was lost and searched the digitized records of the Soviet 57<sup>th</sup> Army.

On this website (<https://pamyat-naroda.ru/>) they found the Combat Operations Log of the 57<sup>th</sup> Army. Pages 4-5 of this document, dated August 4, 1944, contained the following:

*At 1400 on 08/04, in the area 1.5 km southeast of Krasnaya Gorka, a Mustang fighter hit by enemy fire crashed and burned. The pilot RUM of Washington bailed out of the aircraft and was killed when he hit the ground, as his parachute did not deploy.*

There are a few discrepancies in this contemporaneous account, but the discrepancies are not inexplicable. It must be taken into account that on this date and in this area the U.S. did not lose any other P-51 Mustangs. Krasnaya Gorka is three kilometers west of Malaesti. The difference between 1LT Schumacher's estimate of where 1LT McCarthy's Mustang went down and the location cited in the 57<sup>th</sup> Army's Operations Log is roughly

2-4 kilometers. The difference in time could possibly be explained by the time used: Moscow vs. Italian vs. GMT. 1LT McCarthy was from New York, not Washington. It is not clear from the 57<sup>th</sup> Operations Log exactly how the Soviets identified the pilot. It is quite possible that they found some mangled document and drew an incorrect conclusion from this document that his name was RUM and he was from Washington. In any case, this was a good lead that needed to be explored further.

21st Plenum Discussions: U.S. Side researchers continued working and were able to locate the crash site based on archival documents and key information provided by witnesses. This information was found in TsAMO *Fond* 413, *Opis*' 10391, *Delo*<sup>3</sup> 79. On page 64, this summary states that the plane crashed 300 meters east of Height 73.5. This is just north of what is today Bychok, Transnistria.

*Page 64 - Operations Summary #065/OP by the Headquarters, 160th (Red Banner?) Army-Subordinate Machine Gun and Artillery Brigade (APAKBr), 1600, 4 Aug 44, in a hollow 500 meters east Novo-Vladimirovka "... At 1400 on 4 Aug 44, three Fw-190s were flying at low altitude from north to south along the River Dniester. Our small-caliber AAA battery fired one salvo and shot down one aircraft, which crashed 300 meters east of Height 73.5. The aircraft and the pilot burned down."*

DPAA sent an Investigation Team (IT) to Moldova and Ukraine (to include the breakaway Republic of Transnistria) in July 2017 to try to locate the crash site and burial site. They spoke with an 84-year-old resident who remembered the crash site from her childhood. The location she identified was closely aligned as indicated in the archival document, 300 meters from Height 73.5. During last summer's IT mission, investigators did not find any aircraft wreckage on the surface of this field. In addition, the investigators used a metal detector and dug as metal objects were detected. Again they found no aircraft wreckage, but this is understandable in light of the fact that the field has been plowed many times since August 1944. DPAA halted further investigative work at the crash site as evidence indicated that 1LT McCarthy's body had been removed.

In December 2016, DPAA researchers interviewed two men who were teenagers in 1944 and lived in the village of Ploskoye, which is known today as Velikoploskoye, Ukraine. This village is about 15 kilometers to the east of where the front line was in August 1944. During the war, standard practice was to evacuate the civilian population from a 15-kilometer zone behind the front lines. Both witnesses separately recounted a similar story: an American pilot was buried in the church cemetery in the village of Ploskoye. They both recalled a special coffin and a parachute at the ceremony. They both reported that an "American" soldier was present at the ceremony. They knew he was an "American" because he was wearing a different uniform and spoke in English, or so they thought.

---

<sup>3</sup> *Fond*, *opis*', *delo* are the Russian words for records group, inventory, and file.

Meanwhile, U.S. Side researchers continued their work in TsAMO and uncovered the following extract from the 1384<sup>th</sup> AAA Regiment's Combat Journal for August 1944:

*5 Aug 44 - Today, we have witnessed an unfortunate accident. At about 2 p.m., a Mustang aircraft flying at low altitude showed up over our batteries' deployment area, coming from the direction of the enemy's positions. Not far from Krasnaya Gorka, the aircraft went into a "forced" dive and crashed. The aircraft exploded. Possibly, it had been damaged by the enemy. The pilot was a young American. Information on this accident was submitted to the army and front headquarters.*

*7 Aug 44 - Today, the official burial ceremony was conducted for the pilot in the area of the army headquarters in the village Ploskoye.*

Thus, the U.S. Side researchers discovered corroboration of the witness testimony in the form of a contemporaneous log entry. This gives further weight to the likelihood that 1LT McCarthy's remains were buried in Ploskoye. In July 2017, DPAA researchers were able to bring one of the two witnesses to the cemetery. Unfortunately, there are no burial records and no grave markers. The best that the witness could do was to narrow the burial site of the "American" pilot down to a 25 meter by 25 meter area, which is too large of an area to excavate in a cemetery. In addition, there is a contradiction between the witness' testimony and the 1384<sup>th</sup> AAA Regiment's Combat Journal, which states the American was buried next to the army headquarters. From the research done in TsAMO, the 57<sup>th</sup> Army HQ was probably located in the village of Slavyano-Serbka at the time. However, U.S. Side researchers determined that Ploskoye (possibly in its northern part) was also the place where the 57<sup>th</sup> Army's central/main post for aerial surveillance and warning was located.

21st Plenum Discussions: The U.S. Side explained to the Russian Side that despite the amount of work that has been done in the declassified files at TsAMO, the location of 1LT McCarthy's burial site is still unknown.

The U.S. Side shared the following WWII report from Colonel Lukashev, Chief of Political Section, to General-Major Anoshin, the Chief of the Political Directorate of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Ukrainian Front. Lukashev faults the commander of the 4<sup>th</sup> Battery, 1384<sup>th</sup> Artillery Regiment, with shooting down the plane.

*On 4 Aug 44, at 3-4 p.m., the 4<sup>th</sup> Battery of the 1384<sup>th</sup> Antiaircraft Artillery Regiment opened fire on three American fighters of the Mustang type. After a few salvos, one aircraft was downed. The American pilot bailed out and got killed from hitting the ground... At the site of the accident, it was established that the duty telephone operators of the Main Telephone Station had called the Battery to tell [its personnel] not to open fire, since friendly aircraft had been flying in that direction. The 4<sup>th</sup> Battery, which is commanded by Capt. KUZNETSOV, did not cease fire until the aircraft was shot down. In the battery commanded by Capt. KUZNETSOV, observers' knowledge of foreign aircraft silhouettes is poor.*

Taking into account that an American pilot was shot down, that he was buried in a solemn ceremony in Ploskoye, and that an American officer may have been present at the funeral, the U.S. Side believes that it is very likely that reports on this incident must exist in the Russian security services archives. The U.S. Side reminded the Russian Side that a request had been made in April 2017 to search the security services archives for information.

Colonel Nikiforov stated that there are many pieces to this case, and the new information that the U.S. Side unearthed will increase the probability of finding 1LT McCarthy.

The Russian Side agreed to expand the search to security services archives.

### **New Business Discussed During the 21<sup>st</sup> Plenum**

#### **5. NGO “Search Movement of Russia”**

21st Plenum Discussions: Dr. Yelena Tsunaeva stated that in Russia many NGOs do most of the search and recovery for missing soldiers who perished in combat. Dr. Tsunaeva heads the NGO “Search Movement of Russia,” which has 81 regional offices with over 40,000 members, ages fourteen and up. Their areas of interest include search expeditions on battlefields and archival research. Although 70 years have passed, there is still work to be done in 37 regions of modern Russia. The interim results for this year are approximately 15,000 remains recovered, of which just over 700 have been identified.

The individuals that work in this movement are all volunteers. Although most do not have specialized training, they do have many years of practical experience. One group specializes in aircraft searches. They examine crash sites and try to identify the crew and determine the circumstances of the loss based on the wreckage. They experience the same difficulties as the U.S. Side does in that many documents from the period have not been preserved. They are doing search work on Shumshu Island<sup>4</sup>, in the Primorsky Krai, and on Sakhalin Island. If they find anything of interest to the Commission they will pass it to the Ministry of Defense to be shared with the U.S. Side.

Dr. Nenninger expressed his appreciation for the presentation and hopes their services can be leveraged in the future. Dr. Tsunaeva’s organization is similar to the Bentprop Project, a volunteer organization that assists in locating downed aircraft and the recovery of missing aircrews. They primarily operate in the Pacific region.

#### **6. Russian MIAs from WWII**

21st Plenum Discussions: Ms. Mikhailova of the Russian Red Cross Tracing Service requested assistance in locating possible Russian MIAs who may have emigrated to the U.S. after the war.

---

<sup>4</sup> The grave of U.S. WW II aviator, Lt Richard Brevik is reported to be on this island. The Joint Commission Support Division’s predecessor organization has visited here in an attempt to locate his remains.

Dr. Nenninger agreed to check immigration records at NARA, but also noted that most of those records are kept with the Department of Homeland Security. He will seek out the appropriate individuals who can assist in locating possible information. If he uncovers any information he will pass it to the Commission.

## **7. Documents on Soviet POWs from NARA**

Background: The Russian Side has an office at the Russian Embassy in Washington, D.C. There are four staff members at this office that do research in NARA looking for information to clarify the fates of Soviet citizens missing from World War II. DPAA historians and researchers also routinely work at NARA and occasionally come across files that may be of interest to the Russian Side.

21st Plenum Discussions: In the spirit of assisting one another, Dr. Nenninger presented a sample of captured World War II-era German documents pertaining to Russian POWs. These documents were discovered by DPAA researchers while working at NARA. The documents can be found at RG 242, Entry UD 94-A, Boxes 421 and 421A, location 190/17/34/6. If necessary, the U.S. Side agreed to assist Russian researchers in Washington, D.C., to locate these documents.

## **8. Cases of Second Lieutenants Philip Brewer and Eldon Coulson, USAAF**

Background: The U.S. Side raised the cases of 2LT Philip Brewer and 2LT Eldon Coulson, P-38 Lightning pilots assigned to the 95<sup>th</sup> Fighter Squadron, 82<sup>nd</sup> Fighter Group, 15<sup>th</sup> Air Force (AF), based at Vincenzo #11 Airdrome, Italy.

On November 7, 1944, the 15<sup>th</sup> Air Force dispatched 124 P-38s to strafe troop concentrations at Podgorica and roads and railroads between Visegrad-Prijepolje-Sjenica and Sjenica to Novi Pazar in German occupied Yugoslavia. Brewer and Coulson were part of this mission when their squadron accidentally strafed a column of the Soviet 6<sup>th</sup> Guards Rifle Corps that resulted in the death of General-Lieutenant Grigorij Petrovich Kotov.

The 95<sup>th</sup> Fighter Squadron's portion of the mission was to strafe German columns on the road from Novi Pazar to Raska, then from Raska to Mitrovica. However, before they reached their objective, the squadron came under heavy anti-aircraft fire and went off course.

They were flying at 250 miles per hour at tree-top level in order to maintain the element of surprise when eventually they came across terrain features identical to those of their target. The squadron leader believed they were over their objective of Novi Pazar-Raska-Mitrovca, but they were actually in the area of Krusevac-Cicevac-Nis.

On the road from Nis, they came across a column of troops. Because the villages and terrain features matched the target, and the squadron leader thought he was over his

objective, the 95<sup>th</sup> Fighter Squadron attacked. Unfortunately, the column was Soviet, not German.

The Soviet troops were unable to signal to the American fighters that they were attacking friendly forces, even after repeated attempts. Therefore, the Soviets were forced to defend themselves by launching Yak fighters. American and Soviet fighters engaged one another until the Americans recognized they were attacking friendly forces and pulled out. As a result, there were both U.S. and Soviet casualties.

This incident received high-level attention. The U.S. Chiefs of Staff apologized to the Red Army General Staff.

21st Plenum Discussions: On November 7, 1944, three Soviet planes were shot down and two pilots were killed. The U.S. Side pointed out that there is information on the Soviet losses online in the Memorial-OBD website of the Russian Ministry of Defense.

On this website there is a list of Irreparable Losses of the 6<sup>th</sup> Guards Rifle Corps for the period November 1-7, 1944, which contains the names of General-Lieutenant Kotov, Guards Major Grigorij Nikolaevich Naumov, and Guards Lieutenant Aleksej Mikhajlovich Nazarov. The site also contains information on where their remains are buried.

From this list, we know that the body of General-Lieutenant Kotov was returned to Odessa, and that the other officers were buried on the right side of the road from Nis to Belgrade, 3 kilometers from Nis. In addition, the website contains a sketch of the burial location of the junior officers.

Because of the circumstances surrounding this friendly-fire incident, and the fact that it received high-level attention due to the death of General-Lieutenant Kotov, the U.S. Side believes that there would have been some reporting on the disposition of the remains of the American pilots.

The U.S. Side requested a search of the Archives of the Federal Security Service and of the Archives of Foreign Policy of the Russian Federation on the disposition of the remains of Lieutenants Philip Brewer and Eldon Coulson.

To help shed light on the circumstances surrounding this incident, the U.S. Side passed to the Russian Side a declassified, but formerly Top Secret, report dated November 25, 1944, from the Allied Force Headquarters, Mediterranean Theater of Operations, to Major General John Deane, Sr., USA,<sup>5</sup> regarding the November 7, 1944, attack on a Soviet column by U.S. P-38s.

Dr. Nikiforov stated that November 1944 and subsequent months were well documented. The issue that could be problematic is locating exactly where these documents reside. However, he believes that the case has good prospects and will conduct a search.

---

<sup>5</sup> General Deane was the Chief of the U.S. Military Mission to Moscow from 1943-45.

## **9. Technical Sergeants Leonard A. Marino and John L. Sunberg, USAAF**

Background: Technical Sergeants Leonard A. Marino and John L. Sunberg were members of the crew of a B-17G nicknamed “Cubby.” They were assigned to the 8<sup>th</sup> Army Air Force, 487<sup>th</sup> Bombardment Group, 837<sup>th</sup> Bombardment Squadron, based at RAF Lavenham, England. TSgt Marino served as the engineer and TSgt Sunberg served as the radio operator.

On March 18, 1945, the 8<sup>th</sup> Air Force flew several missions to attack rail centers and tank and armament plants near Berlin. The 487<sup>th</sup> Bombardment Group, 837<sup>th</sup> Bombardment Squadron was among those assigned to bomb railroad yards. When they were over their target, their plane was hit by anti-aircraft artillery fire, and they lost two engines.

Operating procedures in force at that time instructed aircrews in trouble on missions over eastern Germany to head for safety in Soviet-held territory. The crew jettisoned their bombs and headed for Poland as instructed. After crossing the Oder River, the aircraft was attacked by four Soviet Yak fighters.

The entire crew was able to bail out of the aircraft. Surviving crewmembers reported that Marino and Sunberg successfully bailed out and appeared to be uninjured. The plane had a crew of nine, and the surviving crewmembers reported counting nine deployed parachutes as they descended.

After landing, the surviving crewmen were collected by Soviet soldiers and taken to the town of Masin, Germany (now Mosina, Poland). As for Marino and Sunberg, the Soviet soldiers reported that both men were dead and would be buried near the crash site. The pilot was given TSgt Marino’s wallet and identification tags and TSgt Sunberg’s Bible. None of the survivors were allowed to see the bodies or witness the burial.

21st Plenum Discussions: As with the previous two friendly-fire cases described above, the U.S. Side believes there should be reporting in the Russian security services archives on this case, especially given the fact that it was a Soviet mistake that led to the death of allied servicemen.

The Russian Side agreed to the U.S. Side request that the security services archives be searched for information on this case.

## **10. Romanian Trophy Documents in the Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense (TsAMO)**

Background: There are eighty (80) U.S. airmen missing from the raid on the Ploesti oil fields in Romania on August 1, 1943, under Operation TIDAL WAVE. There are also five (5) U.S. servicemen missing from separate missions over Ploesti during the spring and summer of 1944. In 2010, the U.S. Side received a listing with a very general description of WWII-era Romanian documents captured by the Soviets as they advanced through Romania toward Germany that are stored in TsAMO.



21st Plenum Discussions: The U.S. Side desires to review these captured documents for information that would lead to clarifying the fates of the remaining 85 U.S. servicemen missing from World War II during missions over Romania. In order to better target the files to be reviewed, the U.S. Side requested a more detailed description of the captured Romanian documents at TsAMO.

Dr. Nikiforov stated that because a third nation is involved (Romania), it creates legal issues. He asked that the U.S. Side provide more specific information on the U.S. losses.

The U.S. Side agreed to provide the names of the remaining eighty-five (85) airmen missing in Romania.

**SUMMARIZED MINUTES**  
**21<sup>st</sup> Plenum**  
**U.S.-Russia Joint Commission on POW/MIAs (USRJC)**  
**Korean War Working Group (KWWG) Talks**  
**November 8, 2017**  
**Moscow, Russian Federation**

**U.S. Side Participants:**

- Colonel Christopher S. Forbes, USA  
Acting U.S. Chairman, USRJC Korean War Working Group  
Director, Europe Mediterranean Regional Directorate  
Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency
- Senior Research Analyst, Korean War Working Group  
Asia-Pacific Regional Directorate  
Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency
- Research Analyst, Korean War Working Group  
Europe Mediterranean Regional Directorate  
Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency

**Russian Side Participants:**

- Colonel General Valeriy Aleksandrovich Vostrotin (ret.)  
Russian Chairman, USRJC  
Chairman of the “Union of the Russian Paratrooper Veterans”
- Colonel Igor Albertovich Permyakov  
Russian Commissioner to the USRJC  
Deputy Russian Chairman, USRJC Korean War Working Group  
Chief, Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense of the Russian Federation
- Korean War Subject Matter Expert  
Department Chief, Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense of the Russian Federation
- Assistant to Colonel Permyakov

**Old Business Discussed During the 21<sup>st</sup> Plenum**

Colonel Permyakov reported that the Russian Side of the Korean War Working Group (KWWG) currently had no Korean War issues for presentation and deferred to Colonel Forbes. Colonel Forbes reported he would like to address issues presented earlier at both the 20<sup>th</sup> Plenum in May

2016, and during the Korean War Technical Talks held on August 8, 2017, in Arlington, VA. The following issues were revisited.

## **1. Staff Sergeant Joseph Stephen Dougherty, USAF**

Background: A document discovered in the Russian archives in 2001 deals with a reprimand of a Soviet officer who came in contact with, and interrogated an American Prisoner of War before turning him over to the North Koreans. The reprimand states that the officer violated standing orders against contact with POWs and spells out the egregious particulars of his disobedience. Further, the reprimand provides clues as to the identity of this POW.

The unnamed POW was identified in the reprimand as a radio operator of a B-29 Superfortress with whom the Soviet officer had contact during October 23-25, 1951. There were three B-29 aircraft shot down on October 23, 1951, and none for the entire month of October prior to the 23rd.

Of the three radio operators assigned to these aircraft, one perished during the shoot down of his aircraft and his remains were found at the crash site. The second radio operator was captured and repatriated after the ceasefire. DPAA analysts were able to contact this man, who upon hearing this story, denied that he was the individual interrogated by the Soviets.

The third radio operator was Sergeant Dougherty, who was listed as MIA until he was presumptively declared dead in 1953. We discussed avenues of research that might yield additional information on this unnamed POW. One suggestion was to look in the personnel file of the reprimanded Soviet officer. Included in his reprimand was a stiff sentence behind bars, and there may be information related to this punishment. Additionally, Soviet intelligence personnel would have had interest in the result of the interrogation.

21st Plenum Discussions: Colonel Forbes recalled that the case of SSgt Dougherty was addressed at the KWWG Technical Talks and how there is a possibility that he may have been in the custody of a Soviet officer for a while in October 1951. Colonel Forbes passed a summary of the Dougherty case in Russian to Colonel Permyakov as promised during the August 2017 Technical Talks.

Additionally, General (ret.) Robert H. "Doc" Foglesong, Chairman of the U.S. Side of the USRJC presented a letter with the Dougherty case summary in Russian to General-Colonel (ret.) Valeriy Aleksandrovich Vostrotin, Chairman of the Russian Side, USRJC, during the opening session of the 21<sup>st</sup> Plenum. In this letter, General Foglesong sought General Vostrotin's assistance in requesting other Russian agencies review their files for information on this incident and Sergeant Dougherty.

Colonel Permyakov responded that they had looked into the case of Sergeant Dougherty in the files of the 64<sup>th</sup> Fighter Aviation Corps (FAC), including the files of the Regiment to which the Soviet officer was assigned. The search included political reports and intelligence correspondence. The Soviet officer was assigned as the Head of the Chemical Services for the Regiment. Additional biographic data on the officer was found, but no further information on Sergeant Dougherty was found in the files of the 64<sup>th</sup> FAC. Colonel Permyakov further reported that they are still looking for additional information in other

places and will send this request to other archives as well. If additional information is found, it will be prepared for release if possible and provided to the U.S. Side at the next meeting of the KWWG.

## **2. Captain Harry Cecil Moore, USAF**

Background: In 1997, DPAA analysts travelled to Taganrog, Russia, and interviewed a 74-year old Soviet veteran of the Korean War. During the interview, the veteran stated that he heard Colonel Ivan Nikitovich Kozhedub, the commander of the Soviet 324<sup>th</sup> Fighter Aviation Division had interrogated an American pilot. The veteran said the pilot's name was Captain Harry or Gary Moore, who had been shot down in the summer of 1951. The DPAA interviewers, had never heard this level of detail before in an interview.

A combat report found in the Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense of the Russian Federation (TsAMO) chronicled an aerial engagement on June 1, 1951, in which the time, location, and the type of aircraft shot down all matched Captain Moore's loss. This document reports that Guards Captain Kalyuzhnyj followed the enemy aircraft to where it crashed into the Korean Bay.

On May 17, 2002, DPAA interviewed Aleksej Alekseevich Kalyuzhnyj in Odessa, Ukraine. According to Kalyuzhnyj, he was credited with shooting down an F-51 Mustang on June 1, 1951, under circumstances that correlate with the loss of Captain Moore's aircraft. Kalyuzhnyj said he followed the F-51 as it headed towards the Korean Bay where it landed in the water 20-30 meters from the shore. He said the F-51 pilot appeared to be in complete control of the aircraft as it gently set down on the sea. He did not see the pilot leave the aircraft but believes that he should have survived the incident.

21st Plenum Discussions: Colonel Forbes recalled the loss of Captain Moore being discussed during the KWWG Technical Talks in August 2017 and how there is a possibility that he too may have been in the custody of the Soviets for a while. Colonel Forbes passed a summary of the Moore loss in Russian to Colonel Permyakov as promised during the August 2017 Technical Talks.

Additionally, General (ret.) Robert H. "Doc" Foglesong, Chairman of the U.S. Side, USRJC presented a letter with the Moore loss summary in Russian to General-Colonel (ret.) Valeriy Vostrotin, Chairman of the Russian Side, USRJC, during the opening session of the 21<sup>st</sup> Plenum. In this letter, General Foglesong sought General Vostrotin's assistance in requesting other Russian agencies review their files for information on this incident and Captain Moore.

## **3. The files of the Air Force Operational Group (AFOG), also known as the Krasovskij Group**

Background: The AFOG was a higher level headquarters that controlled the Soviet 64<sup>th</sup> Fighter Aviation Corps (FAC) and its predecessors for approximately the first year and a half of the Korean War. It is sometimes referred to by the Russian members of the USRJC as the Krasovskij Group, after its commander, Colonel General Stepan Akimovich Krasovskij.

The AFOG was initially formed in the late 1940s to assist the newly formed Peoples Republic of China (PRC) in fending off air attacks from the Republic of China and it controlled all PRC-based Soviet air and anti-aircraft artillery units. The initial cadre of Soviet fighter units deployed to participate in the Korean War were based in Shanghai performing this defensive function before they began flying missions in North Korea. All correspondence to and from the 64<sup>th</sup> FAC was passed through the AFOG until late-1951.

A request to have access to these files was made during the 20<sup>th</sup> Plenum of the USRJC held in Washington, D.C., on May 23-24, 2016. During the August 2017 KWWG Technical Talks, the Russian Side reported they are preparing materials for U.S. researchers from 26 files of the AFOG. These materials should be available for research by the end of the year. These files should contain air combat reports, shoot down reports, search group reports, and other materials of interest to our mission.

21st Plenum Discussions: Colonel Forbes inquired as to the status of the work underway to declassify pertinent files of the AFOG. Colonel Permyakov responded that there may be some documents in this collection related to the fates of U.S. pilots and Russian archivists have prepared the 26 declassified files with CD ROM discs attached and they are now available for study at TsAMO in Podolsk, Russia. The files may not be copied *en masse* for the U.S. Side, but are available for study, notetaking, and presumably small-scale sharing. Colonel Permyakov, who is also the head of TsAMO, expressed a desire to continue working with the former research staff of DPAA's Moscow Office Staff, if possible.

Colonel Forbes reported the U.S. Side is studying various avenues to return our researchers to TsAMO and requested further elaboration on the number and names of AFOG files for planning purposes. JCSD intends to explore those files in early 2018, once we are able to reestablish our research capability in Russia.

#### **4. Russian-language Maps of North Korea and northeastern China**

Background: A request was made during the 20<sup>th</sup> Plenum of the USRJC held in Washington, D.C., on May 23-24, 2016, for 1:50,000, 1:100,000, or 1:200,000 scale maps published in the mid-late 1940s. These maps are crucial to pinpointing crash locations of U.S. aircraft referenced in Soviet Korean War documents since geographic names on 1970s-era and contemporary Russian-language maps do not correspond phonetically with place names used during the Korean War-era.

The Russian Side responded and provided the U.S. Side in May 2017 with a series of 1:100,000 and 1:200,000 maps used during the Korean War. These maps however, were edited, and all margins that would contain additional information such as coordinates, datum, adjoining map sheets, were missing, making it extremely difficult to locate small villages and places referenced in Soviet Korean War-era documents.

This issue was discussed again on August 8, 2017, during the Korean War Working Group (KWWG) Technical Talks with Colonel (Ret) Igor Albertovich Permyakov, Chief of the Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense of the Russian Federation (TsAMO), and the

Russian principal in attendance. The U.S. principal asked if there was a gazetteer available for use with the maps to assist in locating specific locations.

Colonel Permyakov understood our difficulty and stated the maps the Russian Side provided were not quite what was requested. He suggested we provide him with information on our air losses that would include the information we found in our research of the Soviet Korean War documents.

21st Plenum Discussions: Colonel Forbes reported that the U.S. Side appreciates the sharing of Korean War-era maps with it. Colonel Forbes pointed out these maps have limitations and requested that the Russian Side provide 1:50,000 maps as originally requested during the 20<sup>th</sup> Plenum. The current maps are in a scale too large to provide locations for many of the small villages referenced in Soviet documents. Additionally, all margins, which usually provide crucial information for using the maps, have been removed.

During the KWWG Technical Talks in August 2017, both sides agreed that the U.S. Side would provide the Russian Side with a spreadsheet of a number of U.S. aircraft losses to see if crash sites could be pinpointed. This was not to be an inclusive list of all U.S. losses, but would serve as test to see if this procedure could be successful. The methodology was to select losses that are well documented in TsAMO records. There is a binder to go with this spread sheet containing twelve U.S. aircraft losses, from which 34 men remain missing. Each of the entries on the spread sheet has its own tab in the binder and contains specific information such as photographs of wreckage, gun camera film, a well-defined location, such as “three kilometers northwest of” a named town or village, and other information found in TsAMO and U.S. archives to aid in pinpointing crash locations. Colonel Forbes presented this binder to Colonel Permyakov. Colonel Forbes proposed two courses of action:

1. The U.S. can provide a copy of our maps and request that the Russian Side mark where crashes occurred on these maps then return back to the U.S. Side.
2. The U.S. Side can pass along information on the crashes and the Russian Side can then provide the U.S. Side with grid coordinates for these sites.

Colonel Permyakov reported that legends and other information usually found on maps is classified under Russian legislation (and they cannot overstep their rules). He acknowledged that the U.S. Side requires better information for its purposes. He will study the information on crash locations the U.S. Side provided and will endeavor to provide grid locations for them. Colonel Permyakov will ask the head of the Topographic Section for assistance. Colonel Permyakov stated that they wish to work jointly on this issue.

## **5. The Files of the Main Staff of the Air Forces of the Soviet Army**

Background: In November 1951 the relationship between the Soviet 64<sup>th</sup> FAC and the AFOG changed and the 64<sup>th</sup> FAC began to report directly to Moscow. Correspondence was routinely exchanged between the 64<sup>th</sup> FAC and the General Staff of the Soviet Army, the

Main Headquarters of the Air Forces of the Soviet Army, and the Main Headquarters of the Air Defense Forces of the Soviet Army.<sup>6</sup>

The U.S. Side presented Soviet Korean War-era documents collected during its normal research activities at the Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense that proved an abundance of information pertaining to U.S. servicemen, some of whom were never recovered, was sent to the Main Staff of the Air Force.

Among this information are combat reports, intelligence reports produced by the 64<sup>th</sup> Corps, the North Koreans, and the Chinese; interrogation protocols, personal possessions such as photographs, documents and equipment; search group reports, photographs of aircraft wreckage, photographs of human remains, aircraft parts and wreckage.

Colonel Permyakov reported that he would have his team of experts review these files for such information, and if found, would take steps to have pertinent materials declassified and provided to the U.S. Side.

21st Plenum Discussions: Colonel Forbes requested an update on any work done in TsAMO with these files. Much of the information sent to this organization was unique and it was conclusively proven during the August 2017 KWWG Technical Talks that important materials on missing U.S. servicemen was at one time located in these files.

Colonel Permyakov responded that no action has been undertaken yet, however they will look in these records as time permits and report on any recommendations they might have to further advance the issue.

General Vostrotin, in attendance as an observer, reminded the group to be aware of the ongoing situation in northeast Asia and how there may be restrictions on releasing documents related to Korea.

DPAA will provide additional information on these materials in order to dispel any ambiguity or misunderstandings for the Russian Side.

## **6. Declassification Review of the Remainder of Two 64<sup>th</sup> FAC Files (TFR 544 and 545)<sup>7</sup>**

Background: These two files, entitled “Material from the Interrogations of Prisoners of War” remain partially classified to this day. Among the declassified portion of these files are copies of letters of transmittal forwarding captured items to Moscow. Among these items are identification cards, vaccination records, drivers’ licenses, and other personal items belonging to crew members of shot down U.S. aircraft, some of whom were never recovered.

---

<sup>6</sup> All branches of the Soviet military fell under the overall command of the Soviet Army. Since the 64<sup>th</sup> FAC included forces normally subordinated to both the Air Force and the Air Defense forces (*PVO Strany* – included anti-aircraft artillery units and air defense aircraft units) correspondence was sent both to and from the headquarters of these branches.

<sup>7</sup> These two files, internally numbered within the Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency as Transferred Foreign Records (TFR) 142 and 143 were collected from TsAMO and have the TsAMO archival citation of *Fond 64FAC, opis’ 174045, delo 142 and 143*

However, dozens of pages of both these files remain classified. By the very titles of the files, we are certain the classified materials contain information on U.S. servicemen and requested that Colonel Permyakov review the classified portions of these files.

Colonel Permyakov reported that he would have his team of experts review these files, and if information is found, would take steps to have the pertinent materials declassified and provided to the U.S. Side.

21st Plenum Discussions: Colonel Forbes requested an update on the status of these two files. There was some confusion as to what exactly the U.S. Side would like from these files, but both parties agreed to resolve the confusion via official correspondence. Colonel Permyakov believes that we have a mistake in numbering of the two Fonds the U.S. Side is seeking to declassify. The U.S. Side will relook at the numbers and then readdress this issue in the near future.

## **7. Declassification review of TsAMO *Fond 5*, *Fond 40*, and maybe *Fond 3*<sup>8</sup>**

Background: In 1994, the late Colonel Aleksandr Semenovich Orlov, former co-chairman of the Korean War Working Group until his death in 2008, conducted research in the files of the 64<sup>th</sup> Fighter Aviation Corps. Colonel Orlov listed a number of names of U.S. aviators that he found in these documents.

Colonel Orlov indicated in his handwritten notes that he was working in the files of the 64<sup>th</sup> FAC and provided archival citations for the material he found. None of the files he identified as being from the 64<sup>th</sup> FAC had been identified as files we associate with this unit. Among the records he used, it appears that most, if not all, were found in *Fond 5* and *40*, and possibly from *Fond 3*. He lists a number of names, several of which are still missing in action.

The U.S. Side requested access to these *fondy* for documents pertinent to our mission as part of our routine research in TsAMO. At the very least, we would like to request access to the *opisi* collections<sup>9</sup> for these *fondy* so as to identify files of interest for declassification review.

Colonel Permyakov responded that he would have his team of experts review these files, and if information is found, would take steps to have the pertinent materials declassified and provided to the U.S. Side.

21st Plenum Discussions: Colonel Forbes requested an update on these *fondy*. Colonel Permyakov responded that there was still a great deal of classified material in these records, but in his opinion, there was nothing of interest to the U.S. Side. *Fond 40*, he said, is totally unrelated to our work as it concerns Soviet Army assistance to socialist countries. *Fond 3* may be associated as it covers material from the Great Patriotic War and concerns files of the

---

<sup>8</sup> A *fond*, plural *fondy* is a records group. Each Soviet unit down to the regiment level has its own unique *fond*.

<sup>9</sup> *Opis*, plural is *opisi*, translates as “inventory.” These are inventory sheets that accompanied documents when they were accessioned into the archives. These inventory sheets contain the titles of the files that were sent to the archives among other data.



Headquarters of the Supreme Command, and *fond 5* concerns the work of the General Staff and contains no material on POWs.

General Vostrotin suggested the numbers of the *fondy* may have changed and recommended that the U.S. Side reformat its questions on the information we are looking for. The U.S. Side will provide a list of the American names mentioned in COL Orlov's research from 1994 and will prepare official correspondence with attachments explaining its position on these records.

## **8. Finding guides<sup>10</sup> for Anti-aircraft Artillery and Anti-aircraft Searchlight Units**

Background: One of the first things U.S. researchers looked at when we started working in TsAMO were the collections of inventory sheets for the various units assigned to the 64<sup>th</sup> Fighter Aviation Corps. We wanted an understanding of the scope of work required to review these documents at TsAMO.

U.S. researchers were able to view almost all of the inventory collections until we came to the very end. We had only a few left when they were abruptly told that the inventory collections they would like to see were still classified.

The collections we were unable to view were the subordinate regiments of the 28<sup>th</sup> and 92<sup>nd</sup> Anti-Aircraft Artillery Divisions, and one regiment, the 1777<sup>th</sup> Anti-Aircraft Artillery Regiment, of the 87<sup>th</sup> Anti-Aircraft Artillery Division. They were also denied permission to review the inventory sheets of the 10<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> Anti-Aircraft Searchlight Regiments.

The U.S. Side requested access to these inventory sheets, to which Colonel Permyakov said he would look into fulfilling this request.

21st Plenum Discussions: Colonel Forbes requested a progress report on the request to review the inventory collections for these units. Colonel Permyakov requested an official written request be made for this issue via General Popov.

General Vostrotin commented that we need to refine and agree upon our procedures for making requests and passing information. The U.S. Side readily agreed and will prepare official correspondence with attachments explaining its position on these records.

### **New Business Discussed During the 21<sup>st</sup> Plenum**

#### **1. C-47D, tail number 44-77261 21<sup>st</sup> Troop Carrier Squadron, 374<sup>th</sup> Troop Carrier Wing, lost on April 30, 1951**

According to U.S. records, a C-47D, with tail number 44-77261, assigned to the 21<sup>st</sup> Troop Carrier Squadron, 374<sup>th</sup> Troop Carrier Wing, was conducting a leaflet dropping mission on April 30, 1951. On board this aircraft were six men: Captain John S Maniatty, First Lieutenant Wilbert E. Habakangas, Technical Sergeant Robert F. Gross, and one additional

---

<sup>10</sup> Finding guides are what we call collections of inventory sheets (*opisi*) for each unit.

crew member, all assigned to 21<sup>st</sup> Troop Carrier Squadron. Additionally, Corporal Joseph C. Ratti of the U.S. Army, and MSgt Ok Sok Yang, of the Republic of Korea Army.

The aircraft issued a distress call at around 1:00 p.m., which was heard offshore by the U.S. Navy. The C-47 was presumed to have crashed 50 miles south of Wonsan, North Korea. None of the men on board this aircraft have ever been accounted for.

A Soviet archival document, "Report on the Combat Activities and Combat Training of the 64<sup>th</sup> Fighter Aviation Corps for March 1952," (Archival citation TsAMO, *Fond* 64IAK, *opis* 174045, *delo* 104) was found that possibly correlates to the loss of this aircraft and its crew.

This summary contains information from a number of sources, including the North Koreans and Communist Chinese. A section of this report discusses C-47 operational missions and basing in the Korean Theater of Operations. The source of this reporting was stated to be the interrogations of captured aviators (as in more than one), from C-47 aircraft, again, as in more than one.

This C-47 is the only one believed to have been lost behind enemy lines during the entire war from which crewmembers could have been captured. The material on the basing and missions of C-47 aircraft, as stated in the Soviet document, corresponds with U.S. data. It is impossible to discern which two or more crewmembers of the six on board were captured. However, this information suggests that some crew members survived the crash of their aircraft.

There are two discrepancies that need to be addressed. First, the wording of the document indicates that the captured airmen came from more than one C-47. Secondly, there is almost an eleven-month lapse from when this C-47 was lost to when this information appears in the Soviet report. While the exact reason of this delay is unknown, it might be explained by the lengthy process required to interrogate prisoners, translate the interrogations from either Korean or Chinese into Russian, share the information with the Soviets, and for this information to make its way into this report.

DPAA analysts have long known that interrogation materials were of great interest to the Soviet Union during the war. Collecting such materials are routine events. In addition to the interrogation materials collected by the Soviets themselves, much information was shared by the Chinese Volunteers, and the North Koreans. We have many examples of interrogation protocols and other documents such as this one and other intelligence summaries that show this was a routine occurrence.

However, all of the interrogation protocols we have seen were for men that were repatriated at the end of the war, and unfortunately, none of these documents contained archival citations. What we ask, is for your team of experts to see if they can locate interrogation information on captured aircrew from C-47 aircraft so that we can clear up this mystery.

A discussion ensued between Colonels Forbes and Permyakov on this issue. Colonel Permyakov emphasized how difficult a request this is for Russian archivists to study.

Nevertheless, he agreed to research this issue. Colonel Forbes suggested that this issue be shared with the security services archives as well and that this issue will also be presented via Chairman to Chairman channels.

## **2. Records Stored in the Archives of the President of the Russian Federation (APRF)**

In the mid-1990s, the U.S. Side had a research contract with the Russian Diplomatic Academy to look for records related to the four conflicts in the Archives of the President of the Russian Federation and in the Archives of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. This contract was very useful in providing many historical documents that helped educate us on these conflicts from the Soviet point of view.

Unfortunately, one of the reports that was written on the research work was misplaced after it was sent to our office in Washington. The recipient put it in his desk drawer and forgot about it. When he retired from this organization, his papers were put in a box and disappeared until recently found. The report, for research done in August-September 1996, lists documents all dealing with the Korean War that were found in *Fond 43, opis' 60* of the Archive of the President of the Russian Federation. Some of these documents are strictly political and of little interest, but a number of them deal with conducting the war, wartime events, and operations reports.

Our understanding is that all of these files have been declassified and are available for study. If so, we would like for our researchers to be able to examine them and make copies of documents useful to our work. In order to do this, we seek your assistance in arranging this access for us.

After clarifying several issues with this request, Colonel Permyakov stated he will prepare correspondence to the administration of the APRF requesting access.

## **3. Demographic Questionnaires and Soviet Involvement with U.S. POWs During the Korean War**

Regardless of assurances by Colonel Orlov and others that any contact the Soviets had with U.S. POWs was incidental, casual, or unauthorized, and even though we have seen documents in the records of the 64<sup>th</sup> Fighter Aviation Corps at the Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense which verify there were orders forbidding this contact, we believe that the Soviet Union had an active program to contact, interrogate, and collect information from U.S. POWs that was underwritten by an unidentified Soviet agency.

We have studied all available debriefings of repatriated U.S. Air Force POWs from the Korean War and a few debriefings of army soldiers and marines. We concluded from these debriefings that there was an active program of contact and interrogation of some POWs undertaken by the Soviets. Active enough that we have excluded the possibility that this contact was incidental, casual, or unauthorized. The primary focus of these contacts appears to have been an interest in background and demographic information, as opposed to tactical or strategic intelligence, although this material was sometimes also gathered.

These debriefings are supported by the testimony of Vladimir Il'ich Bubnov, a former Soviet officer, English language translator, and member of the Soviet Advisory Group who stated that he translated thousands of demographic questionnaires of U.S. POWs that were forwarded to the 2<sup>nd</sup> Main Directorate of the Soviet Army.

TFR 1218 is a document containing information on Polish-American POWs from the Korean War. The exact provenance of this document is unknown; however it appears to have been provided to the Polish Security Services in 1952 by an unknown country. We received it from the Institute of National Remembrance, Office for the Preservation and Dissemination of Archival Records in Warsaw, Poland. The self-described mission of this institute is to collect, preserve, edit, and disclose archival material accumulated by the former Polish secret security apparatus in the period from July 22, 1944 to December 31, 1989, as well as documents of the security organs of the Third Reich and the Soviet Union related to Nazi and Communist crimes, crimes against peace and humanity, war crimes, and other political repressions committed against people of Polish nationality or Polish citizens of other nationalities from September 1, 1939 to December 31, 1989.

This document is a conglomeration of documents in Chinese, Korean, English, and Russian. There are 182 pages in this entire document. They appear to be predominantly demographic questionnaires of U.S. POWs of Polish ethnicity. All of these individuals were repatriated; however this is an interesting document in that it proves by translation into Cyrillic that the Soviets were accumulating this information as well.

As is evident, the emphasis of this material concentrated on personal information on the POW and his family. The collectors were interested in who the POW was for reasons we will not speculate upon. We believe the Chinese collected this material and had it translated into Russian and Korean for sharing with the intelligence apparatuses of those two countries.

The materials contained in this document found in Poland contain only a small percentage of this sort of information collected during the Korean War and was shared with Poland because it dealt specifically with ethnic Polish POWs. We are certain that thousands more of these biographies were collected and shared between the Soviet Union, the People's Republic of China, and the Democratic People's Republic of Korea.

Colonel Forbes then presented a list of 586 missing U.S. Air Force servicemen that was extracted from the larger list of all missing U.S. servicemen from the Korean War (PMKOR). He requested that Colonel Permyakov seek out the repository of these materials and check the names from the PMKOR to see if such a questionnaire exists for them. Through the years of our work, we have been able to refine the ultimate fates of a number of servicemen and move them from our MIA list to the POW list. If a questionnaire exists for any of these individuals it would indicate that he had been a prisoner of war at some time and would shed additional light on an individual's fate.

Colonel Permyakov found this presentation very interesting and agreed to look into this matter.

#### **4. Miscellaneous New Issues**

- Colonel Permyakov asked for help researching WWII Lend-lease information. Colonel Forbes responded that the Russian Side's office in Washington, D.C., has access to all unclassified and declassified files in U.S. public archives and may research as often and as long as they want. Further, Colonel Forbes will ask the Dr. Nenninger of the National Archives and Records Administration (NARA) and U.S. Commissioner for WWII to facilitate this research as much as possible. Colonel Forbes also suggested the Roosevelt Presidential Library in New York City as a potential source of materials on the Lend Lease Program.
- Colonel Forbes asked Colonel Permyakov if there was a work-around to the 60-day advance notification requirement to request permission to conduct research in TsAMO. Colonel Permyakov responded the requirement is still in force.
- Colonel Permyakov requested that we add a column to the list of 586 missing aircrew members that defines their role, ie: crewmember, pilot, passenger etc.

**SUMMARIZED MINUTES**  
**21<sup>st</sup> Plenum**  
**U.S.-Russia Joint Commission on POW/MIAs (USRJC)**  
**Cold War Working Group (CWWG) Talks**  
**November 8, 2017**  
**Moscow, Russian Federation**

**U.S. Side Participants:**

- Mr. Timothy C. Shea  
U.S. Commissioner to the USRJC representing the Defense Intelligence Agency  
U.S. Chairman, USRJC Cold War Working Group  
Defense Intelligence Officer for Europe/Eurasia
- Dr. James G. Connell, Jr.  
Acting Executive Secretary, U.S. Side of the USRJC  
Senior Research Analyst, Joint Commission Support Division  
Europe Mediterranean Regional Directorate  
Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency
- Research Analyst, Cold War Working Group  
Europe Mediterranean Regional Directorate  
Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency

**Russian Side Participants:**

- Colonel General Valeriy Aleksandrovich Vostrotin (ret.)  
Russian Chairman, USRJC  
Chairman of the “Union of the Russian Paratrooper Veterans”
- Colonel Andrey Leonidovich Taranov (ret.)  
Russian Commissioner to the USRJC  
Executive Secretary, Russian Side of the USRJC  
Deputy Director, Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Those Fallen in Defense  
of the Motherland, Ministry of Defense of the Russian Federation
- Mr. Aleksandr Fedorovich Mukomolov  
Russian Commissioner to the USRJC  
Russian Chairman, Cold War Working Group  
Member of the Russian Presidential Commission on Human Rights
- Dr. Pavel Vasil’evich Pinchuk  
Russian Commissioner, USRJC  
Chief, 111th Main State Center of Forensic Pathology, Russian Ministry of Defense
- Deputy Director, North American Center

## Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation

Following pleasantries and introductions, the Russian Side of the CWWG presented the following issues on which it seeks assistance:

- The recovery and identification of the approximately 264 missing Soviet service members from the Soviet War in Afghanistan. The biggest obstacle facing the Russian Side is how to find Soviet soldiers who left Afghanistan for third countries during and after the war. They have worked with the late Ludmilla Thorne<sup>11</sup> in the past for assistance in identifying those missing.
- The Russian Side would also like training assistance on new techniques of forensic identification of remains. Currently, the Russians only have expertise in the use of mitochondrial DNA for identification. They are planning to attend the proposed Vietnam War Working Group Technical Talks planned for Hawaii in April 2018, and would like to speak with DPAA scientists on various identification technologies available.
- The Russian Side requested help in locating their missing from the various conflicts in Chechnya, Ingushetia, and South Ossetia.<sup>12</sup> According to Mukomolov, there are approximately 300 missing service members from the conflicts in the Northern Caucasus. They also hold thousands of sets of remains for which they seek assistance in the identification process. The Russian Side would like for a third party to interview Chechen emigres for information on mass burial sites. The Russian Side seeks no retribution; they merely want this information to find and repatriate its missing servicemen.

### Old Business Discussed During the 21<sup>st</sup> Plenum

#### 1. Letter to General-Colonel Vostrotin on wider archival research

Background: On August 9, 2017, General Robert “Doc” Foglesong, Co-chairman of the U.S. Side of the USRJC, sent a letter requesting that the search for information on the nine remaining Cold War shoot down incidents be reinvigorated in the sensitive archives of the Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense at Podolsk, Central Archives of the Russian Navy at Gatchina, and the Central Archives of the Border Guards. General Foglesong additionally requested that this search be expanded to include the Archives of the President of the Russian Federation (APRF) as well as the Archives of the Federal Security Service.

21<sup>st</sup> Plenum Discussions: Mr. Shea asked if any action has been taken yet on the Foglesong letter. Colonel Taranov stated that a request for information had been sent to the APRF and to the Border Guards Archives. Colonel Eduard Paderin, Chief of the Archival Service of the Ministry of Defense of the Russian Federation is supervising this effort. The Russian Side

---

<sup>11</sup> Ms. Thorne was actively involved in the Soviet Human Rights Movement and was the Director of the Russian Area Program at Freedom House in New York City. She passed away in December 15, 2009.

<sup>12</sup> Among these conflicts are the First and Second Chechen Wars, the South Ossetia War, and the Russo-Georgian War.

will forward any information if it is found to its Washington, D.C., office. Colonel Taranov had no information as yet regarding the requests to the APRF or the Archives of the Federal Security Service.

## **2. November 6, 1951, P2V and the June 13, 1952, RB-29 Archival Research Update**

Background: The USRJC has discussed these cases numerous times during past plenary and technical talk sessions, most recently during the last two technical talk sessions. The Russian Side claims that both of these aircraft were shot down over the Sea of Japan and the CWWG has established that there were many Soviet vessels active in the Sea of Japan during these incidents. The U.S. Side has postulated that deck logs of Soviet patrol craft may contain information on recovery operations conducted by the Soviet Navy; however, the Russian Side claims smaller patrol vessels did not maintain traditional deck logs. The U.S. Side requested that the Russian Side go back once again and investigate their archives to determine if deck logs did or did not exist, or if larger ships in the area kept deck logs based on reports from smaller patrol craft. The Russian Side agreed and also offered to search Anti-Air Defense logs in an attempt to refine the last known coordinates of the P2V when it crashed.

21<sup>st</sup> Plenum Discussions – Mr. Shea asked if there was any progress in the U.S. Side's request for deck logs of Soviet patrol ships. Colonel Taranov stated the search was negative and no additional information was found. He reiterated the Russian position that traditional deck logs were not maintained on smaller patrol craft. Colonel Taranov reported they are still working on air defense logs so as to triangulate the last known position (by the Soviets) of the P2V.

## **3. Access to the Archives of the Northern and Black Sea Fleets**

Background: In the 1990s, the late Rear Admiral (ret.) Boris Gavrilovich Novyj and Dr. James Connell visited Severomorsk (Northern Fleet Headquarters), Sevastopol (Black Sea Fleet Headquarters), and Vladivostok (Pacific Fleet Headquarters). As a result of these visits, the U.S. Side in 2005 requested access to the archives of the Northern, Pacific, and Black Sea Fleets via direct correspondence through the Russian Side to the Chiefs-of-Staff of each fleet. Only the Pacific Fleet in Vladivostok responded, resulting in permission for Admiral Novyj to work in its archives in 2005. Naval archives are one of the most likely places where information may be found about U.S. Cold War aircraft losses that occurred at sea. The U.S. Side has repeatedly requested access to conduct research in the archives of Northern and Black Sea Fleets.

21<sup>st</sup> Plenum Discussions – Mr. Shea asked if there was any progress on gaining permission for Commission researchers to work with the holdings of the Northern and Black Sea Fleet archives for information about missing American servicemen from the Cold War-era. Due to the sensitivity of materials in these archives, the Russian Side recommended that the U.S. Side work with the Russians to identify a trusted agent, such as Admiral Novyj, to conduct research. The Russians would vet and if acceptable, permit the trusted agent to work in the requested archives. The U.S. Side would have direct input into the selection of the



researcher, but ultimately, it would be the decision of the Russian Side to permit access to the archives. JCSD will begin to search for a trusted Russian researcher and propose him to the Russian Side for their approval and to gain access.

#### **4. Aircraft Factory #315**

Background: At the Commission's 18<sup>th</sup> Plenum in November 2002 (and in several correspondences since then), former U.S. Co-chairman Major General Roland Lajoie requested confirmation of reports that wreckage from downed Cold War-era U.S. aircraft – specifically the U.S. Navy PB4Y-2 “Privateer,” shot down on April 8, 1950, – were sent to Aircraft Factory #315. Then Russian Co-chairman General Major Vladimir Zolotarev responded that the FSB was still looking into the matter.

21<sup>st</sup> Plenum Discussion: Colonel Taranov said the U.S. Side will not be permitted to visit Factory #315. However, the Russian Side had offered to examine any archives associated with this factory for any relevant information. Mr. Shea inquired as to the status of this research. Colonel Taranov reported that this investigation is still underway and he will report back to the U.S. Side with any information if found.

#### **New Business Discussed During the 21<sup>st</sup> Plenum**

##### **1. Proposed June 2018 expedition to the Vladivostok region**

Background: Investigators from DPAA's predecessor organization have travelled several times to the Vladivostok area of the Russian Far East to investigate possible crash sites of U.S. aircraft, including the November 6, 1951, shoot down of the Navy P2V. However, these investigations were not conducted with the rigor required by today's scientific criteria. DPAA Europe Mediterranean Regional Directorate now possesses the capacity for a comprehensive investigation.

Additionally, the late Vladimir Trotsenko, who was a patient in 1951 in military Hospital 404, located in the Far East, claimed he encountered four U.S. servicemen in this hospital who were recuperating from injuries. He testified that at least one of these servicemen succumbed to his injuries and was subsequently buried near Hospital 404 in the village of Novosyoyevka. Because of the confluence of times with the November 6, 1951 shoot down and Mr. Trotsenko's stay in the hospital, the U.S. Side believes it is worth conducting a scientific reinvestigation in the Vladivostok region.

21<sup>st</sup> Plenum Discussion – Mr. Shea detailed two investigations that had been carried out in October 1995 and in March-April 1996. Even though these investigations had not resulted in any positive identifications, the U.S. Side feels that further investigation into Hospital 404 and the local cemetery where an American was reportedly buried is warranted. Additionally, the U.S. Side would like to reinvestigate three crash sites located in the *Primorsky kray*<sup>13</sup>. The U.S. Side proposed April or May 2018 for a possible expedition. Colonel Taranov stated

---

<sup>13</sup> A *kray* is a geographical administrative division often located along the borders of the former Soviet Union and the Russian Federation as well. *Primorsky kray* is an area located along the sea, and *Primorsky* means “by the sea.”

the Russian Side has already agreed to this expedition and requests that the proposed dates and rough locations be given to the Russian Side as soon as possible for planning. Mr. Shea concurred and will provide this information as soon as it is available. DPAA currently plans to conduct a joint U.S.-Russian investigation expedition to the Vladivostok area to investigate the cemetery in vicinity of Hospital 404 and three airplane crash sites of interest in May 2018.

## **2. Request for additional research on the July 29, 1953, shoot down of the USAF RB-50**

Background: On July 29, 1953 a USAF RB-50 was shot down while performing a reconnaissance mission over the Sea of Japan. Search and rescue operations were conducted from 29-31 July, 1953. This search resulted in the rescue of the aircraft's co-pilot, Captain John E. Roche, by the USS *Picking* on July 30, 1953. Documents previously provided by the Russian Side report that Soviet Air Defense forces saw seven parachutes from the burning aircraft. U.S. archival information reports that U.S. search and rescue operations noted several Soviet vessels in the vicinity of the shoot down, which was confirmed by a 1953-era Soviet document that confirmed nine Soviet "cutters" from the Pacific Fleet were present. As previously pointed out by the Russian Side, small patrol craft did not keep deck logs.

Soviet archival documents report that two Soviet MiG-17 fighters, flown by Captain Rybakov and Senior Lieutenant Yablonovskij from a Pacific Fleet Naval Aviation unit engaged the RB-50. The Soviet documents report that the American plane, "while breaking into pieces, fell in flames into the water 15 km (eight miles) to the south of Askol'd Island." In a 1953 letter to Defense Minister Bulganin, Fleet Admiral Kuznetsov detailed the American search operations and stated that Soviet Trawler #423 was approached by two American destroyers in an attempt to get information regarding the RB-50.

U.S. military authorities tracked the RB-50 during the course of its flight and saw the radar trace of the American plane merge with the track of an unidentified plane. Five additional plots were reported in the ten minutes after the two radar traces merged. It is unclear whether this tracking reflected the RB-50 taking evasive action or whether the tracking represented the interceptor aircraft after the interception occurred.

U.S. search and rescue reports and intelligence reports indicate that between nine and twelve Soviet ships to include destroyers, submarines, minelayers, three unidentified minesweepers, three submarine chasers and smaller surface craft were tracked in the area of the crash on 30 July 1953.

On June 10, 1993, U.S. interviewers met with retired Soviet Sergeant Georgiy Yakovlevich Kravchenko in Moscow. Kravchenko served as an anti-aircraft gunner on Russkiy Island near Vladivostok in 1953, and reported he saw the shoot down of the RB-50 as well as seven parachutes descending from the burning aircraft. He confirmed this in a subsequent interview in October 2001. The U.S. assumed that three of the parachutes belonged to crewmembers Roche, O'Kelly, and Brown, all of whom were known to survive the shoot down. Only Roche was recovered.

Information concerning this case had been presented to the Commission by retired Soviet Colonel Gavril Korotkov, a former Soviet military intelligence officer who was stationed in Khabarovsk during the period of the Korean War (1950-53). He stated in a BBC interview in 1993 that he personally interrogated an American prisoner during this period. Colonel Korotkov said that he had heard that a large U.S. plane had been shot down in the Vladivostok area, crashed into the sea, and some crewmembers were able to parachute from the plane sometime after the Korean War ceasefire was signed on July 27, 1953. He said that he and other military intelligence specialists heard that survivors had been picked up by Soviet forces.

21<sup>st</sup> Plenum Discussion – Dr. Connell handed over copies of 163 pages of information that had previously been provided to the Russian Side. He requested that the Russian Side review the documents with the hope of identifying additional avenues of research. General-Colonel Vostrotin asked if this is the exact material that had been presented to the Russian Side in 1993, or was there additional information included. Dr. Connell stated that not much had been added. Vostrotin indicated that the Russian Federation has acted upon this information, but agreed that additional work is needed. Dr. Connell reiterated that he hopes the Russian Side can review the materials and perhaps suggest additional avenues of research that the U.S. Side may have overlooked. General Vostrotin agreed with this proposal and stated that by calling the attention of the Russian Side to these documents once again, it shows an element of trust between the two Sides. Dr. Connell stated that the U.S. Side is very grateful for the large number of documents provided through the years, which included declassified reports to Admiral Kuznetsov and to Stalin.

### **3. U.S. Air Force C-124 Loss on March 23, 1951**

Background: On March 22, 1951, after refueling at Loring Air Force Base (AFB) in Maine, a USAF C-124, tail number 49-0244, took off for Mildenhall Royal AFB in England. Early on March 23, about 700 miles southwest of Ireland, the C-124 issued a Mayday call. The C-124 ditched in one piece, and its location was reported by a U.S. B-29 in the area. One of the largest search and rescue operations in U.S. history was mounted and nothing of the airplane or its passengers was ever found. There were reports that Soviet submarines and surface ships were active in the area of the crash. The U.S. Side requested any assistance from the Russian Side in researching this incident.

21<sup>st</sup> Plenum Discussion – Colonel Taranov indicated that researchers with special skills would be needed to research this incident. The Russian Side indicated that if we could come up with approved researchers, they would be allowed to carry out research. General Vostrotin indicated that a specialist would have to sift through a lot of information. He said that, in general, archivists have difficulty researching technical documents, which is why a specialist in this type of material is needed. Vostrotin indicated that if Soviet ships were in the area they should have logs.

Closing – At the end of the meeting, the Russian Side took the opportunity to repeat their requests concerning Afghanistan, Chechnya, Ingushetia, and South Ossetia. Colonel Taranov stated that they are interested in interviewing former Soviet service members who had

emigrated to the U.S. in an effort to gain information concerning missing personnel and they would like to interview Chechens living abroad concerning mass burials in Chechnya.

Taranov stressed that the interviews could be anonymous and that the Russian Side just wanted information. Mr. Shea asked if the Russian Side had the names of those they are wishing to interview. Colonel Taranov indicated that they have a list of names and photos and letters from those people. General Vostrotin requested that the U.S. Side “simplify” this task. Mr. Shea indicated that the U.S. Side will see what they can do, but it will be very difficult due to privacy and legal restrictions. He then asked the Russians to provide the questions they want asked and coordinates for the persons, and stated that perhaps we can act as an intermediary.

Mr. Shea thanked all present for a cordial and productive exchange of information and opinions.

**SUMMARIZED MINUTES**  
**21<sup>st</sup> Plenum**  
**U.S.-Russia Joint Commission on POW/MIAs (USRJC)**  
**Vietnam War Working Group (VWWG) Talks**  
**November 8, 2017**  
**Moscow, Russian Federation**

**U.S. Side Participants:**

- Mr. Kelly K. McKeague,  
USRJC Commissioner representing the Department of Defense  
U.S. Chairman, Vietnam War Working Group  
Director, Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency
  
- Technical Lead, Vietnam War Working Group  
Senior Research Analyst, Joint Commission Support Division (JCSD)  
Europe/Mediterranean Regional Directorate  
Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency
  
- Research Analyst, Vietnam War Working Group  
Europe Mediterranean Regional Directorate  
Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency
  
- Mr. Bob Wallace, Observer  
Executive Director, Washington Office, Veterans of Foreign Wars (VFW)
  
- Mrs. Ann Mills Griffiths, Observer  
Chairman of the Board, National League of POW/MIA Families

**Russian Side Participants:**

- Acting Chairman, Vietnam War Working Group  
Deputy Chief, Archival Service of the Russian Ministry of Defense
  
- Senior Researcher, Research Institute of Military History  
General Staff of the Russian Armed Forces
  
- Senior Researcher, Research Institute of Military History  
General Staff of the Russian Armed Forces

**Old Business Discussed During the 21<sup>st</sup> Plenum**

The Russian Side reported that the Russian Side of the VWWG had been working with the classified Vietnam War-related records from the Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense of the Russian Federation (TsAMO). At this session, he would share the results of that research and outline the next steps.

Mr. McKeague expressed his satisfaction with the progress the VWWG has made and his hope that communication between the two sides will continue to improve. He emphasized the importance of being able to rely upon former Soviet advisors and veterans as resources for the POW/MIA mission.

## **1. Updates to Total Missing from the Vietnam War**

Background: The U.S. Side has provided to the Russian Side updates in the past on the current status of recoveries and the numbers of missing U.S. servicemen from Southeast Asia.

21<sup>st</sup> Plenum Discussions: Mr. McKeague updated the working group on DPAA's progress in the search for missing Americans from the Vietnam War and provided DPAA fact sheets reflecting operations in Vietnam, Laos, and Cambodia. Since the February 2017 Technical Talks, 15 U.S. service members have been accounted for, and the number of the missing as of November 9, 2017 is 1,602. Mr. McKeague explained that, in addition to the list of all missing U.S. personnel, a brief description of each person and his case are now published on the DPAA website. The Russian Side expressed interest in accessing this material.

Note: Profiles of Unaccounted For Personnel: Over the past year, DPAA has been publishing to our website profiles of the missing that summarize the circumstances in which these brave individuals served our country. This collection may be found at:  
<https://dpaa.secure.force.com/dpaaProfileHome>.

## **2. Research Methodology**

Background: In the past, the U.S. Side has presented a number of lists to facilitate archival research by Russian researchers. Among these lists are: "U.S. Air Losses in the Vietnam War," "U.S. Personnel who Died in Vietnamese Captivity," "U.S. Personnel Last Seen Alive," and "Unknown Crash Sites."

21<sup>st</sup> Plenum Discussions: The Russian Side discussed the methodology of archival search currently employed by Russian researchers. They suggested that in order to prevent redundant research, instead of searching for information using the various lists already provided, it would be more efficient to have a master list of all missing servicemen from the Vietnam

War. While the Russian Side stated that they are open to other methods, they feel this would be the most practical. The U.S. Side agreed and will provide a master list as requested to the Russian Side.

### **3. Soviet Participation in the Vietnam War**

Background: It is a well-known fact that the Soviet Union sent advisors and specialists to North Vietnam during the Vietnam War.

21<sup>st</sup> Plenum Discussions: The Russian Side offered more information on the role Soviet advisors played in the Vietnam War. According to him, Vietnamese leaders viewed the Soviets' primary mission as to train air defense system operators. They added that their participation was limited to tactical and technical roles, and stated that Soviet advisors had almost no access to interrogation materials, nor direct contact with POWs. While the Russian Side did say that their researchers had come across brief interrogation reports, they were drafted by the North Vietnamese and were passed to Soviet advisors to be used for technical information.

### **4. Status Report on Research in TsAMO**

Background: A six-person team is presently conducting research in TsAMO with records related to the Vietnam War. Its research is currently concentrated on 113 volumes of Top Secret and Secret materials. As of June 2017, the team had reviewed approximately 40 percent of these records.

21st Plenum Discussions: Mr. McKeague thanked the Russian Side for its efforts and for the excerpts from interrogation reports it provided to the U.S. Side earlier this year. He added that all Americans named in these reports were repatriated. Mr. McKeague asked for a status report on the ongoing research.

Russian researchers estimated they have reviewed approximately 60 percent of the records in this collection. A discussion ensued on the difficulties encountered and the scope of future work to research Vietnam War records. The Russian Side wanted to give the U.S. Side "a better understanding of what kind of results to expect." He emphasized that this is an exhaustive process considering the large volume of materials.

Of note, every line on every page must be read. Many of the records they have examined were handwritten, which further complicates the process. Many reports from Vietnam were sent through different channels to different higher headquarters in the USSR. For example, a document, while referencing a prisoner interrogation, may not necessarily contain the

interrogation transcript itself, which might have been sent to a different addressee (and, subsequently, may be kept in a different collection or a different archive).

Researchers realized they have a lot more work to do than initially believed. After they review all the records in this 113-volume collection of documents, they will have to move to other records collections, such as the Archives of the Main Staff of the Air Force of the Soviet Army and the Archives of the Air Defense Forces of the Soviet Army, both of which are kept at TsAMO.<sup>14</sup>

The Russian Side made sure the U.S. Side had an understanding of the process and warned against unrealistic expectations. They further suggested, even though they were not sure, that information on POW/MIAs could be found in other archives such as the FSB and GRU archives.

Mr. McKeague asked whether researchers made note of references to other archives when encountered in the records under review, to further facilitate their research, to which he received an affirmative response. Mr. McKeague then queried whether the researchers have access to those “other” archives. The Russian Side clarified that the research team only had access to records controlled by the Ministry of Defense, which does not include the Main Intelligence Directorate of the Russian Ministry of Defense or other such archives controlled by separate agencies such as the Military Intelligence Service.

The Russian Side suggested requests for access to other “restricted archives” be addressed to General Vostrotin, the Commission’s Russian Chair.

## **5. Soviet Participation in Combat During the Early Years of the War**

Background: During the February Technical Talks, Russian subject matter experts alluded to that fact that Soviet servicemen serving in North Vietnam may have actually participated in combat.

21st Plenum Discussions: Referring to a statement made at the February Technical Talks, Mr. McKeague hypothesized that if Soviet pilots participated in aerial combat, then the relevant records should be among the classified material the researchers were reviewing. Mr. McKeague provided a 1965-referenced record from the Russian Ministry of Defense website that stated that Soviet pilots in MiG-17s started the record of combat actions in the skies of Vietnam by shooting down two American F-105 aircraft.

---

<sup>14</sup> All branches of the Soviet military fell under the overall command of the Soviet Army. Vietnam War materials for the Soviet Air Force, Air Defense Forces (*PVO Strany* – included anti-aircraft artillery units and air defense aircraft units), and the General Staff of the Soviet Army are located in TsAMO.



To facilitate archival research, Mr. McKeague provided the Russian Side with a spreadsheet containing details of USAF F-105 Thunderchief aircraft lost in 1965 and information on ten missing service members associated with these aircraft.

The Russian Side stated that they would look into the matter.

## **6. U.S. Air Losses During the Vietnam War**

Background: Earlier this year, the U.S. Side submitted to the Russian Side lists of U.S. air losses in Vietnam, Cambodia, and Laos from 1965-1968 in order to facilitate their research.

21st Plenum Discussions: Mr. McKeague provided the Russian Side with a list of all U.S. air losses in Vietnam, Cambodia, and Laos from 1968-73. The U.S. Side has now provided the Russian Side with lists of all air losses in those three countries from 1965-1973.

The Russian Side stated that they would compare their information to the U.S. Side's and establish which, if any, U.S. service members are recorded as returned or missing. He expressed doubt that any information on losses in Cambodia and Laos would be found, since there were no Soviet advisors or anti-aircraft forces there.

### **New Business Discussed During the 21<sup>st</sup> Plenum**

#### **1. Reinvigoration of the DPAA Oral History Program**

Mr. McKeague discussed the possibility of reinvigorating the DPAA Oral History Program for the purpose of locating, screening, and interviewing knowledgeable Soviet officials and advisors living in Russia who served in the Vietnam War.

The U.S. Side offered to provide the Russian Side with a questionnaire to distribute to Soviet veterans of the Vietnam War. Based on the responses of these questionnaires, the U.S. Side would identify individuals to interview fully.

The Russian Side was amenable to the idea and would conduct initial screening interviews of the Soviet veterans.

#### **2. U.S. Over-Water Losses**

Mr. McKeague discussed U.S. over-water losses. He asked about the possibility of reviewing reports by divers from Soviet trawlers during search-and-rescue operations for missing service members. He said that the U.S. Side is preparing a full list of all over-water

losses and presented a sample of five such cases. Mr. McKeague inquired about the possibility of conducting searches of relevant Russian Naval Archives concurrently with the search in TsAMO.

The Russian Side was doubtful about the divers being from trawlers and suggested that perhaps they were reconnaissance ships which were subordinate to the Soviet leadership in Vietnam. They added that if that were the case, then their reports should have been included in the reports to the 10<sup>th</sup> Main Directorate of the Ministry of Defense.

### **3. Archival Citations on Records Provided by the Russian Side**

Mr. McKeague thanked the Russian researchers for the excerpts from the interrogation reports provided to the U.S. Side earlier in the year. He added that the reports did not include archival citations or the archive of origin. This information is helpful in directing research and often provides clues as to additional materials of interest. Mr. McKeague requested that citations be included on subsequent reports.

The Russian Side agreed that archival citations should be provided and stated that it will be done.

### **4. Request for a Search of the Security Service and Military Intelligence Archives**

Mr. McKeague indicated to the Russian Side of a letter sent in August 2017 from General Foglesong to General Vostrotin requesting a search of relevant historical information in the FSB and GRU Archives and asked if there was any update to this request. The Russian Side advised the U.S. Side to ask General Vostrotin during the closing session of the Plenum.

### **5. *Spetsgrupp*a Reports**

Background: *Spetsgrupp*a (literally “Special Group”) included teams of Soviet technical experts who were tasked with collecting U.S. equipment from downed aircraft and sending it to the USSR for exploitation.

Mr. McKeague explained that access to reports made by the *Spetsgrupp*a might provide the names of U.S. POWs/MIAs, or leads to the identification of POW/MIAs. Mr. McKeague handed the Russian Side a Soviet document describing over 700 pieces of equipment from U.S. downed aircraft, which were collected and sent to the USSR for exploitation. He added that such records could assist in locating reports made by the *Spetsgrupp*a.

After examining the document, the Russian Side stated that *Spetsgrupp*a records might be kept in the Archives of the President of the Russian Federation (APRF). The Russian experts noted that it should be taken into consideration that the Vietnamese were very reluctant to provide Soviet specialists access to crash sites, U.S. equipment, and captured pilots. Mr. Pokladov explained that search for the *Spetsgrupp*a records would require access to the GRU archives. He went on to say that even though the GRU is part of the Ministry of Defense, its archives are kept separately. The Russian Side stated that such access is a question for General Vostrotin.

## **6. Conclusion**

Mr. McKeague expressed his great respect, sincere gratitude and appreciation for all the cooperation and extra work that the Russian researchers have been doing. He underscored that he would like them to know that their efforts do make a difference. When the families get answers about their loved ones, there is no greater feeling of satisfaction. He added that that was why this work is so honorable. Mr. McKeague asked if they had any requests for the U.S. Side.

While the Russian Side did not have any specific work-related requests at that time, the researchers stated that working for the POW/MIA mission and searching historical records is most interesting for them. They expressed a hope that relations between the U.S. and Russia would soon improve.

Mr. McKeague responded that it is very encouraging that on this particular mission, our countries can work openly and candidly, which could lead to other areas where common ground could be found.

**Break-Out Session Adjourned.**

**SUMMARIZED MINUTES**  
**21<sup>st</sup> Plenum**  
**U.S.-Russia Joint Commission on POW/MIAs (USRJC)**  
**Closing Session**  
**November 8, 2017**  
**Moscow, Russian Federation**

**Participants:** Same as Opening Session

General Vostrotin convenes the closing session of the 21<sup>st</sup> Plenum.

**Statements from Observers from the Veterans of Foreign Wars (VFW) and the National League of POW/MIA Families (the League)**

- Bob Wallace, Executive Director of the VFW stated that he was able to sit in for portions of all four working groups and witness the discussions taking place. The message he will take back to U.S. veterans is that the USRJC is open for business, and he hopes that the discussions today will lead to positive results in the future.

General Vostrotin thanked Bob Wallace, noted that the Russian Side was well aware of the capabilities of the VFW, and stated that the VFW's input was very important.

- Ann Mills-Griffiths, Chairman of the Board for the League, stated that her organization has worked closely with Mr. Wallace for decades and noted that Americans value the participation of veterans groups in this work as much as Russians appreciate their veterans' efforts. Mrs. Mills-Griffiths thanked the Russian Side for opening an office in Washington, D.C. She thanked the Russian Side for facilitating the successful participation of Colonel Taranov in the 48<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the National League of POW/MIA Families this year in Washington, D.C. Mrs. Mills-Griffiths noted that Colonel Taranov received a standing ovation during the event, which indicates that family members are not looking to cast blame, rather they are seeking answers to what happened to their loved ones. She understands that the Commission's work is difficult and thanked the members for the renewed effort being made.

General Vostrotin thanked Mrs. Mills-Griffiths for her permission to use the League's POW/MIA symbol for the 25<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Medallion and stated that it is the most appropriate symbol to use for the Commission's work.

General Vostrotin stated that he hopes to continue working with the League and the VFW in the future.

General Vostrotin called for reports from each working group.

**World War II Working Group**

- Colonel Nikiforov thanked the U.S. Side for providing information on the deaths of the Soviet pilots from PBN-1 Nomad, Bureau Number 02826<sup>15</sup>. The Russian Side shared some information on the USS *Herring*. He stated that the Commission has created favorable conditions for working in TsAMO, as well as in NARA. The Russian Side received some information on missing servicemen, which will help clarify their fates. The U.S. Side made some requests for information on some of their missing servicemen. These cases are still lingering from the previous century, which emphasizes the on-going nature of the work of the World War II Working Group. The center of gravity is moving towards Europe, which is where the fighting took place. This creates some challenges, but there is hope for some results before the next meeting.<sup>16</sup>
- Dr. Nenninger thanked the Russian Side and noted that although we did not solve any of the cases, we have come up with additional research paths to pursue. Specifically, the U.S. Side will provide the Russian Side with a Japanese document on the USS *Herring* to help clarify the circumstances of the loss. The U.S. Side will provide the names of 85 U.S. losses in Romania to assist in narrowing the search in Romanian trophy documents. The U.S. Side thanked Dr. Tsunaeva for her presentation on her Russian search movement and looks forward to working with her, most likely in the Far East where the U.S. may have a number of aircraft losses. The U.S. Side raised three specific cases involving friendly fire. Colonel Nikiforov agreed to search through security services archives to try to find answers to these cases. Additionally, Ms. Mikhailova is interested in Russian citizens who may have emigrated to the U.S. immediately after World War II. The U.S. Side will search through NARA records for any publically available information. In conclusion, the U.S. Side provided some information on Soviet prisoners from World War II found in NARA and agreed to inform the Russian Side as new information is located.

General Vostrotin commented that the World War II Working Group sets the example for the rest.

## **Korean War Working Group**

---

<sup>15</sup> The information Colonel Nikiforov refers to are the X-files provided to the Russian Side during the February 2017 Technical Talks in Moscow, Russia. On June 17, 1944, Colonel Viktor Nikolayevich Vasilyev and his crew of five were ferrying a Lend-Lease PBN-1 Nomad from Elizabeth City, NC, to Vaenga Airfield, Murmansk *Oblast*, Soviet Union. It is believed that this aircraft crashed on Andotten cliff over Finkonviken Bay, Norway. At the time, the crew was mistakenly identified as American, and the Germans buried four sets of remains recovered from the crash site in the local Hasvik Cemetery. After the war, the American Graves Registration Command (AGRC), U.S. Army Quartermaster Corps, disinterred the remains from the Hasvik Cemetery. The AGRC took these to Neuville-en-Condroz, Belgium, and buried them on July 19, 1946. The X-files provided to the Russian Side in February 2017 contain forensic analysis and dental charts for the four sets of remains. The Russian Side is currently analyzing the information provided in these files and looking for descendants of the missing from this incident to collect family reference samples.

<sup>16</sup> The challenges that Dr. Nikiforov speaks of more than likely refer to the fact that most of the fighting, especially the fighting that resulted in U.S. missing, occurred on territory that is no longer controlled, or heavily influenced, by Moscow, i.e. Ukraine, Belarus, Poland, and other eastern European countries. If the losses were on Russian territory, it would be easier to organize on-site investigations and excavations.

- General Vostrotin asked that Colonel Permyakov address a question that came up during the Cold War Working Group meeting regarding some subordination changes that have taken place concerning the Baltic, Pacific and the Black Sea Fleets.
- Colonel Permyakov, Chief of TsAMO, explained that the archives of military districts, fleets, and service branches, that used to be independent, have recently been incorporated into the structure of the Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense. Therefore, Colonel Permyakov asked that all requests for military archival searches come through the Commission to TsAMO in Podolsk. He stated that this is the proper way to organize Commission business and that it will expedite archival searches for information.
- Regarding the Korean War, all issues raised were discussed. Colonel Permyakov stated that a work methodology was agreed upon by both the U.S. and Russian Sides. The U.S. Side passed information on U.S. missing servicemen, and the Russian Side will conduct an archival search for information on these missing servicemen. He also stated that both sides thoroughly discussed how to use archival documents in a way that will not violate the laws of either country.
- Colonel Forbes stated that the U.S. passed a book of 12 incidents with 41 missing servicemen. The information on these incidents originated in Russian archives, and the Russian Side agreed to attempt to pinpoint the crash locations. Concerning new business, Colonel Forbes stated that a missing C-47 with six unrecovered crewmembers was discussed. The U.S. Side presented information found in Poland on demographic questionnaires of U.S. servicemen of Polish ethnicity who were POWs during the Korean War. The documents are in the Korean, Chinese and Russian. All of the persons in these questionnaires were returned. The U.S. Side asked the Russian Side to try to search for additional questionnaires and compare them with the list of almost 900 names of unrecovered Air Force personnel from the Korean War. If additional questionnaires are found it is not necessary to provide them to the U.S. Side if it is determined that the serviceman are accounted for. Perhaps additional fate-related information may be found.

General Vostrotin said that the Korean War Working Group has the Chief of TsAMO [Colonel Permyakov] who has 90% of the information and 90% of the resources at his disposal. Therefore he is hopeful that we will hear some answers to these questions soon.

### **Vietnam War Working Group**

- The Russian Side stated that both sides got to know each other, which is 50 percent of success. The Russian Side shared the results of what was accomplished since the previous meeting [in June 2017]. The U.S. Side provided answers to all questions from that meeting. Both agreed on the goals and identified tasks.
- Mr. McKeague thanked the participation of three experts from the Institute of Military History. He stated that the Russian Side was able to provide the U.S. Side with additional documents. The Russian Side agreed to provide questionnaires to Air Defense veterans. Additionally, the U.S. Side provided several lists of shot down U.S. aircraft to

help guide Russian researchers. The U.S. Side understands that information is needed from FSB and GRU archives and reminded the Russian Side of a request from General Foglesong for assistance in accessing these archives. Mr. McKeague noted that both Chairmen Foglesong and Vostrotin provided all the working groups with a strategic framework and agreed on the need to formalize operational protocols for the working groups in order to increase momentum and create tangible actions. Mr. McKeague stated that they have already seen the results by working with the family groups who are the beneficiaries of those tangible actions.

General Vostrotin noted that the Chief of Archival Service of the Ministry of Defense is in a position to greatly aid our work.

### **Cold War Working Group**

- Colonel Taranov stated that the Cold War Working Group has the most difficult conditions due to the need to protect State secrets. Nevertheless, we are trying to find ways that will allow us to shed light on circumstances surrounding the loss of American servicemen. The sides discussed several incidents of U.S. aircraft losses during the Cold War, some organizational issues related to accessing archival documents, and a potential joint search mission to the Russian Far East to investigate several loss incidents.
- Mr. Shea added to Colonel Taranov's summary. He noted that the Cold War Working Group has a number of issues that fall outside of the Cold War. The Russian Side made requests for information on Russian missing from the Afghanistan, Chechen, and Georgian conflicts. Mr. Shea mentioned that the Russian Side suggested a 2019 scholarly conference be held at the PVO (Anti-Air Defense) Museum that would discuss the nine incidents of missing U.S. aircraft from the Cold War. He also stated that the U.S. Side will try to interview Afghan veterans and others to try to find answers for the Russian Side.

General Vostrotin acknowledges that this working group is the most challenging. He also says that it is within their power to change the name of the working group if that is deemed necessary. He offers "The Post-War Period Working Group" as a possible solution.

### **Closing Discussion**

Following the working group reports a discussion on the future of the working relationships between the two Sides ensued. General Vostrotin says that we have lost a lot of time over the past 25 years and much of it was because of misunderstandings on how to make requests. Among the steps he envisions are to:

- Formalize the format that requests for information are made to the archives and to create a template for these requests.
- All Commission requests for Ministry of Defense archival materials should be addressed directly to TsAMO. This procedure should streamline the current process significantly.

- General Vostrotin suggested that it also makes sense to focus our efforts on those cases that have a higher chance of being successful, rather than spending precious time on those that have little chance of resolution. Each request should come with an estimate of probability of success. If a request has a 1% chance of leading to information, he suggested we put it aside and address a different issue.
- It is apparent that the archives of the FSB and the Main Directorate of the General Staff of the Russian Armed Forces need to be included in the information sharing process. General Vostrotin will investigate this issue and provide an answer to the U.S. Side.
- Veterans and Family service organizations' participation in USRJC meetings is positive and should continue.

General Foglesong responds that:

- He would like to formalize the meeting schedule. The next plenum will be held next year around the same time, but in the U.S. He would like for the Commission in addition to hold a technical talk session for each working group prior to the next plenum.
- General Foglesong proposed establishing a joint special study group that will report to the Commission in the next few months.
  - The first issue to study is whether there are alternative ways to release information in an unclassified format while allowing each side to maintain its nation's secrets. This is a fundamental issue to the commission's work.
  - The second issue to study is to assess the scope of the Commission. Perhaps, there are other working groups we need to add or areas to expand into.
- General Foglesong proposed that both Sides write a corporate paper of proposals.
- To expedite matters, General Vostrotin countered with the proposal that each side draft its own proposal for the special study group and then both sides compare and come up with a joint document.

General Vostrotin declared the closing of the 21<sup>st</sup> Plenum of the USRJC.